

Joint Seminar: Phi/Theo
PHIL 43801/THEO 43202 Sec. 01
Religion and Science

Professor Matthew Ashley, Theology
442 Malloy / 1-7077 / ashley.2@nd.edu
Office hours: Tue/Thurs, 11 – 12 noon

Professor Don Howard, Philosophy
308 Malloy / 1-7547 / dhoward1@nd.edu
Office hours: Tue/Thurs, 11 – 12 noon

Course Meetings: Tuesdays, Thursdays, 12:30 – 1:45 pm / 220 Malloy Hall

This course will examine the intersections of science, philosophy, and theology, with attention to three historical cases: (a) the Galileo affair, (b) controversies over Darwin and natural selection, and (c) contemporary debates [history in the making] over evolutionary psychology and the status of the soul as the marker of the imago Dei. In each part we will alternate detailed consideration of historical case studies with careful theological and philosophical analysis of key concepts and argumentative strategies. Along with the expectation of informed discussion, each student will be required to write three short papers (one for each topic) and a term paper.

Course Texts:

Richard Blackwell, *Galileo, Bellarmine and the Bible* (Notre Dame, In.: University of Notre Dame, 1991). [in bookstore]

Ernan McMullin (ed.), *The Church and Galileo* (Notre Dame, In.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005).

Karl Rahner, *Hominisation; The Evolutionary Origin of Man as a Theological Problem* (New York: Herder & Herder, 1965)

Course Requirements:

Informed Discussion: 15%

Since this course is a seminar, each student should come to each session prepared to raise questions about the readings and respond constructively to questions posed by other seminar participants.

Short Papers: 15% each

Each student will write three short papers (5 – 10 pages), one for each of the major divisions of the course. In the paper the student will pick a particular issue and analyze that theme, following it through the course readings. Besides accuracy of readings of texts, papers will be evaluated according to the students ability to take an interesting position on the theme that she or he chooses and to argue it persuasively in the course of the paper. While the theme can be predominantly philosophical or theological, given the integrative character of the course, a predominantly philosophical paper should at some point discuss the theological presuppositions or ramifications of the philosophical themes under consideration, while a predominantly theological paper must do the same with respect to theological issues.

Term Paper

40%

A final term paper (15 – 20 pages in length) will be due on Monday, May 7 (of finals week). Students will meet with course instructors following Spring Break to discuss their topics.

SCHEDULE

DATE	TOPIC	READINGS
Jan 16	Introduction to the course	
Jan 18	Galileo affair background: theological	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Blackwell, chapter 1• Decrees of the Council of Trent, Session IV: Blackwell, Appendix 1• Diego de Zuñiga, <i>Commentary on Job 9:6</i>: Blackwell, Appendix 2
Jan 23	Galileo affair background: scientific	
Jan 25	Galileo & the Bible: I	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Blackwell, chapters 2& 3• Bellarmine, <i>de controversiis</i> (Blackwell, appendix 3)
Jan 30	Galileo & the Bible: II	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Galileo's <i>Letter to Castelli</i>, Blackwell, Appendix IV• Galileo's correspondence with Dini: Blackwell, Appendix 4• Ernan McMullin, "From Augustine to Galileo," <i>The Modern Schoolman</i> LXXVI (January/March, 1999), 169-194 [on electronic reserve]
Feb 1	Foscarini	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Blackwell, chapter 4• Foscarini's defense and Bellarmine's response: Appendix 7 and 8
Feb 6	Galileo's defense	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Blackwell, <i>Galileo, Bellarmine and the Bible</i>: chapter 5• Galileo's notes on Bellarmine's critique of Foscarini: Appendix 9
Feb 8	Conclusions	Blackwell, chapters 6 & 7

Feb 13	Galileo today: I	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • John Paul II's statement on the Galileo Affair¹ • Dei Verbum [available on-line at the Vatican's website]
Feb 15	Galileo today: II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Michael Sharratt, "Galileo's 'Rehabilitation': Elbow-Room in Theology," in <i>The Church and Galileo</i> (book on reserve), 323-339. • George Coyne, S.J., "The Church's Most Recent Attempt to Dispel the Galileo Myth," in <i>The Church and Galileo</i>, 340 – 359.
Feb 20	Underdetermination: I	Duhem, "Physical Theory and Experiment"
Feb 22	Underdetermination: II	
Feb 27	Darwin: the theory	Ernst Mayr, <i>What Evolution Is</i> , 1-11, 73-90, 115-34 [e-reserve]
March 1	Darwin: the initial reception <i>First analytical paper due today</i>	John Hedley Brooke, "Darwin and Victorian Christianity," in Hodge and Radick (eds.) <i>The Cambridge Companion to Darwin</i> , 192-213
March 6	Early U.S. Protestant responses: Charles Hodge and B.B. Warfield	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Charles Hodge, <i>What is Darwinism?</i> 85-98, 129-34, 149-57 • B.B. Warfield, <i>Evolution, Science and Scripture: Selected Writings</i>, ed. Noll and Livingstone (Baker Books, 2000), 132-42, 270-87.
March 8	Catholic Responses ²	John Zahm, CSC, <i>Evolution and Dogma</i> (selections)
SPRING BREAK		
March 20	Teilhard de Chardin	Teilhard de Chardin, <i>Christianity and Evolution: Reflections on Science and Religion</i> [selections]
March 22	Scopes/Creationism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ronald Numbers, "The Creationists," in

¹ Available on-line at <http://www.its.caltech.edu/~nmcenter/sci-cp/sci-9211.html> .

² Students should plan on attending the lecture on Zahm presented by Thomas Glick, one of the co-authors of *Negotiating Darwin: The Vatican Confronts Evolution, 1877-1902*. This lecture will take place Thursday afternoon at 4:30. Place TBA.

		David Lindbergh & Ronald Numbers, eds., <i>God & Nature</i> , 391-423 [ereserves] <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Edward Larson, “The Scopes Trial,” in Gary Ferngren (ed.), <i>Science & Religion</i>, 289-98 [ereserves]
March 27	Philosophy of Science	
March 29	Wrap-up	Dover, PA decision by Judge John E. Jones III ³
April 3	Wrap-up	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cristoph Cardinal Schönborn, New York Times op-ed column (July 7, 2005) • International Theological Commission, “Communion and Stewardship: Human Persons Created in the Image of God”⁴ • John Paul II message to Pontifical Academy of Science on evolution⁵
April 5	Reduction/emergence: philosophical issues	
April 10	Scripture & soul <i>Second analytical paper due today</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • John W. Cooper, <i>Body, Soul and Life Everlasting</i>: selections (ereserves) • Joel Green, “Restoring the Human Person: New Testament Voices for a Wholistic and Social Anthropology,” in Robert Russell, et al. eds., <i>Neuroscience and the Person</i> [ereserves]
April 12	Patristic Resources	Brian Daley, “A Hope for Worms: Early Christian Hope,” in Ted Peters, et al., eds, <i>Resurrection: Theological and Scientific Assessments</i> [ereserves]
April 17	Karl Rahner	Karl Rahner, <i>Hominisation: The Evolutionary Origin of Man as a Theological Problem</i> (selections)
April 19	Nancey Murphy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nancey Murphy “The Resurrection Body and Personal Identity,” in <i>Resurrection: Theological and Scientific Assessments</i>, 202-218

³ Available at http://www.pamd.uscourts.gov/kitzmiller/kitzmiller_342.pdf .

⁴ Available on-line at

http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/cti_documents/rc_con_cfaith_doc_20040723_communion-stewardship_en.html .

⁵ Available on-line at <http://www.its.caltech.edu/~nmcenter/sci-cp/evolution.html> . Alternatively, if you can read Spanish (!), a Spanish translation is available on the Vatican’s website.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Idem., “Supervenience and the Downward Efficacy of the Mental: A Nonreductive Physicalist Account of Human Action,” in Russell, Murphey, et al (eds.), <i>Neuroscience and the Person: Scientific Perspectives on Divine Action</i> (Notre Dame Press, 1999), 147-64
April 24	Evolutionary ethics & theology: I	
April 26	Evolutionary ethics & theology: II	
May 1	<i>Third analytical paper due today</i>	