Book Review Section and Communications

A NOTE FROM THE BOOK REVIEW EDITOR: FOCUS ON DEVELOPMENT

The institutional aspects of development have been a major concern of marketing as a discipline from its very inception. While the concern at the beginning of the twentieth century was with the development of the marketing system in the United States, the focus today has shifted to the developing countries of Africa, Asia, and Latin America. Macromarketing researchers, starting with the pioneering works of Professor Charles C. Slater, have always given development problems a central place on their agendas. For example, the two international conferences on marketing and development (see Sherry's review essay below) have been cosponsored by the *Journal of Macromarketing*.

The lead review essay by John Sherry weaves together themes from two marketing and two anthropological volumes dealing with problems of marketing and development. Trained in anthropology and steeped in marketing and consumer research, Sherry has the unique ability to assess the emergent directions as well as shortcomings of development studies in both fields. Combining succinct summaries with insightful critique, Sherry's review essay creates a portrait of the state of research in marketing and development: where we are and what challenges we face.

Frank Meissner is perhaps best characterized as the leading practitioner-scholar of marketing and development. He has long championed the role of marketing studies in development projects of international agencies. He finds the international agencies beginning to pay more attention to marketing problems in the two reviews that follow Sherry's essay. The first is a two-volume World Bank collection, Agricultural Marketing Policy, produced in conjunction with a seminar on this topic organized by the Bank's Economic Development Institute. The second is a collection of papers on marketing of public enterprises in developing countries, arising out of a project on this topic undertaken by K.L.K. Rao at the United Nations-supported International Center for Public Enterprises in Developing Countries. Meissner finds the scholarship as well as practical guidelines in the older field of agricultural marketing much better than in the newer field of public enterprise marketing. Taken together, all these reviews make a compelling case for improving macromarketing research and practice in the area of development.

> Nikhilesh Dholakia Book Review Editor

MARKETING AND DEVELOPMENT: A REVIEW ESSAY

Development Economics on Trial: The Anthropological Case for a Prosecution Polly Hill (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1986)

> Marketing and Development: Toward Broader Dimensions Erdogan Kumcu and A. Fuat Firat (Greenwich, CT: JAI Press, 1989)

Marketing and Economic Development: Issues and Opinions James Littlefield and Magdolna Csath (Blacksburg, VA: Virginia Tech, 1988)

Production and Autonomy: Anthropological Studies and Critiques of Development John Bennett and John Bowen (New York: University Press of America, 1988)

JOURNAL OF MACROMARKETING 65

Marketers soon will have to grapple with what the Germans have termed Sinnkrise, that crisis of meaning which has arisen from the loss of credibility of the "master narratives" that comprise the explanatory systems of EuroAmerican culture (Godzich 1985, p. 427). Elsewhere (Sherry 1989) I have described the effect of the postmodern condition on inquiries into marketplace behavior and have advocated a discoursecentered approach to research. Just such an approach to development studies is being consolidated in other disciplines (Escobar 1988; Klamer and others 1988) and has begun to diffuse into marketing. Recently, Adler and others (1989) have suggested that the use of grounded theory, constructed through anthropological methods, may be essential to any valid understanding of managerial practice. Since marketing is a powerful agency of cultural stability and cultural change, it is imperative that researchers investigate the ethnocentric frameworks that shape programs of directed intervention. The rhetoric conditioning our perception of such processes as the "globalization of markets" (Levitt 1983) or the "pluralization of consumption" (Levitt 1988) has profound implications for development at the levels of policy and practice. The very concept of the "informal economy," for example, is sufficient to impede progress at each of these levels (DeSoto 1989). Thus, I have adopted an anthropological perspective in this essay and will review a number of volumes critical of economic development as conventionally conceived.

The volume by Polly Hill is an appropriate point of departure for a critical appraisal of development. The author of this engaging book adopts an approach which she christens polemical and constructive. Her purpose is to expose the tempocentric and ethnocentric biases of conventionally economic orientations to development and to demonstrate the utility of economic anthropology to a redirecting of our conceptual and practical efforts. That fundamental research rather than merely applications-driven investigation should be a principal concern of development specialists is cogently argued by the author. So also is the hegemony of economics effectively questioned.

Stylistically the book is a treat to read. Employing a conversational tone that is rhetorically rich—her use of apostrophe, irony, sarcasm, and parenthetical expression are especially effective—the author draws (or, depending upon disciplinary allegiance, provokes) the reader into a dialogue that challenges received wisdom and the apparently commonsensical. This style more than adequately compensates for the episodic character of the essays on substantive issues which fuel the author's polemic. A glossary is thoughtfully appended to the text, as are appendices to particular chapters. A precis for each chapter is provided in the Contents.

The author grounds her argument in ethnographic data on arable farming societies from Anglophone West Africa and South India and uses textbooks in development economics as a foil against which to espouse her heterodox views. Strategically, Hill seeks to demonstrate the "viability of tropical economies" and to refute the "doomsday economics" that threatens to abort development regimes even before implementation is attempted. She explores the promise of and prospect for "indigenous economic development" and criticizes economists' calls for unrealistic and ultimately ineffectual reform packages.

Hill does much to unpack and reposition the notion of externality in economic development. She selects a number of central issues for critical reappraisal: "Peasant," "household," "inequality," "debt," "credit," "poverty," and the like are examined in cross-cultural and, occasionally, cross-disciplinary perspective. Her advocacy of pluralist methodology produces insight into such fundamental issues as the statistical invisibility of important sectors of economies and the impoverished nature of analytic constructs (for example, our failure to examine relationships between households in a community; our ascription of moral connotations to indebtedness). Her examination of credit-granting mechanisms in tropical economies could easily be abstracted and recalibrated to illustrate the kinds of barter and countertrade deals that account for increasingly large proportions of world business. The sources and consequences of development specialists' neglect of the role of women is suggestively broached by the author. The failure of these same specialists to realize and deal with the fact that the richest farmers frequently derive the most lucrative profits from nonfarming occupations is discussed as an impediment to rational development.

Macromarketers perhaps will be most interested in Hill's discussion of the ideological, methodological, and historicist biases that result in generalizations which not only are not valid but also have harmful consequences for the populations who are their intended beneficiaries. Her proposed remedy for these biases—additional empirical work and critical attention to existing ethnographic data—is incipient in the volumes treated next in this review.

This polemical attitude is transmuted and harnessed in a state of the art book edited by Kumcu and Firat. The book, the fourth supplement to Jagdish Sheth's *Research in Marketing* series, has its genesis in the enthusiasm, commitment, and scholarship attending the First International Conference on Marketing and Development, held in 1986 in Istanbul. The conference has become a biennial event. Its

66 FALL 1989

conveners, the authors of the present work, envision a discipline of marketing that will contribute to improving the human condition rather than serving strictly managerial ends or reflexively reinforcing the culture of consumption. The authors have compiled a book which they hope will prompt a reassessment of the culture-bound "concepts, perspectives and models" of North American students of development and a critical evaluation of the contribution of EuroAmerican marketing to the kinds of development desired by those living in developing countries. The volume is further intended as an outlet for critical and novel perspectives of development, a kind of sheltered workshop for alternative conceptualizations. As an indication of their radical earnestness, the authors eschew the label "economic development" in favor of the more balanced "development" in the title of their book. That this revisionist rhetoric is not adopted by half of the volume's contributors, or that such ethnocentric labels as "LDC" are retained, is some indication of how pervasive and unquestioned our constructs have become and how untractable they may be despite our best critical intentions.

The first four chapters set the tone for the book. Kotler's introductory essay examines impediments to development from First and Third World perspectives, describes dilemmas that arise in the development planning process, and proposes a set of guidelines to direct development wherever it should occur. The "high concensus" regarding the propriety of these principles that Kotler attributes to the guidelines, which are chiefly a set of EuroAmerican directives grounded primarily in economics, highlights the tension implicit in externally imposed versus indigenous intervention strategies. Kotler laments the absence of "strategic marketing thinking" in the planning process shaped by Third World economists and offers a number of implementable suggestions to improve this process. And yet, the ultimate strategic marketing challenge-discerning indigenous desires and empowering local communities to satisfy those desires in culturally appropriate ways, adapting the ideology and technology of marketing to local realities—is not addressed in this chapter.

In a review essay that provides working definitions of such elusive terms as "growth," "development," and "modernization" and surveys work on the relationship of marketing and development in historical perspective, Savitt proposes an "unconventional" perspective of an emerging field. Our knowledge is both encyclopedic and shallow, given our potential effect on planners and their constituencies; the integrity of the discipline depends in part upon expanding the scope and methods of inquiry into marketing. (The call by Dant and Barnes, in a later chapter on cross-cultural research, for the collection and evaluation of more "people data"—that is, emically driven constructs to aid etic analysis—is one potential corrective.) For Savitt, the most plausible starting point for this expansion and for consolidated integration of our literature is economic theory. Regrettably, alternative or complementary sources of theory are not examined.

Kazgan uses conventional economic principles to generate and test a number of hypotheses linking marketing activity and development. This empirical chapter is as insightful for its identification of issues requiring future research as for its primary analysis. Programmatic investigation of complex interrelationships, however, will require accepting Savitt's challenge to broaden our perspectives.

Dholakia's exploration of the marketing of development, in particular his critical evaluation of the process of strategic development affecting all types of societies, provides an indispensible counterpoint to the early chapters of the book. His discussion of the influence of marketing upon the "professional visionaries" charged with shaping the future is a poignant reminder of the pressing need for comprehensive descriptions of the culture(s) of development so absent from our literature. Finally, his comparison of alternative paradigms of strategic development, grounded in the world as it is, makes discussion of development ethos and guidelines with practical application a feasible undertaking.

A second set of chapters addresses the globalization phenomenon and its role in the inexorable diffusion of consumer culture. Dholakia and Firat describe, from the perspectives of several different literatures, the dynamics underlying the emergence and transformation of markets and consumer behavior patterns in the wake of the spread of advanced capitalism. They propose an integrative model that questions the primacy of marketing as an arbiter of development and reveals some of the contradictions and consequences of capitalist approaches to development.

Belk provides an instructive overview of the historical roots of consumer culture and the role of hedonism and envy provocation in the countering of economic and ideological impediments to the diffusion of this culture to the Third World. He argues persuasively against the existence of a world standard package of consumer goods and demonstrates effectively, in considering some of the consequences of the diffusion of consumer culture, that the very concept of "goods" is a dangerous misnomer. (In fact, a later chapter by Nevett advises developing nations to regulate advertising through legal means, rather than permit Westerm-style industry regulation, until na-

JOURNAL OF MACROMARKETING 67

tional goals surpraordinate to increased consumption are met.) An unfortunate consequence of our scholarly geopolitical gerrymandering is Belk's neglect of Fourth World consumer culture.

A chapter by Dholakia, Sharif, and Bhandari documents the growing polarization of Third World consumers into overprivileged and underprivileged segments and calls for a reorientation of development goals to meet the needs of the masses. Social justice is the object of such a revitalized development, and the cases of "successful" indigenous development identified by the authors from throughout the world's economies pose particular challenges to the marketing imagination. The reader concludes the first portion of the book with a renewed sense of the nested complexity of the relationship between macromarketing and social architecture.

A final set of chapters explores a number of issues in distribution and channel management as they relate to development. Layton provides a meticulous survey-based account of local level response to an imposed initiative in coastal Java to demonstrate the compatibility of traditional distribution with industrial development. The chapter nicely illustrates how managerial and public policy implications of applied research depend upon enlightened implementation: Local producers must be empowered if marketingbased intervention strategies are to succeed.

The emergence and flourishing of the informal sector as a critical market mechanism are explored in a fundamental contribution by Robles and El-Ansary. The authors document market researchers' surprising neglect of such economic activity and propose both a typology of informal sector enterprises and a model of formal and informal market interactions in developing nations. The utility of such exploration to developed nation studies is implicit but not examined by the authors. A host of marketing implications of this formal-informal sector articulation is identified by the authors, and programmatic research directions are outlined.

Two case studies, one on an Israeli national export marketing program for produce (by Berman, David, and Meissner), the other on channel development for agricultural supplies (by Sorenson), provide a sense of local grounding and range of impedimenta with respect to systemic marketing intervention efforts.

The volume concludes with a capstone chapter by Firat, Kumcu, and Karafakioglu that highlights the problems with conceptualizations, methods, and perspectives employed by marketers interested in development. They propose a multidimensional definition of development that posits social, political, ecological, economic, and psychological components in a dynamic interplay. They advocate supplementing logical empiricist approaches to inquiry (especially within comparative marketing studies) with approaches more sensitive to cultural and temporal context. Finally, they observe that many "need-related processes" essential to development are not mediated by "the market" and require researchers to relinquish their ethnocentric paradigms (whether these be neoclassical economic theory, stages of cultural evolution, pan-cultural rationality, or the like) before understanding can be achieved.

The volume by Littlefield and Csath, while heir to the effort of Kumcu and Firat, is in some ways a lacklustre successor. Because it is a proceedings volume (of the Second International Conference on Marketing and Development), the reader is alert to the eclectic topical coverage and variable quality of the papers before ever opening the book.

While comparison to its predecessor is somewhat unfair, it is also unavoidable. Kumcu and Firat have pared and honed an assortment of contributions and have provided the integration requisite to producing a "book." This they have done a considerable time after the conference providing the impetus for their collected papers. Littlefield and Csath have opted for a timely turnaround-a service much undervalued in our field-at some cost in terms of production values and eclectic, variable scholarship. As a result, the papers are generally brief (some maddeningly, others mercifully so), speculative if not provocative, and frequently related only obliquely to the topic of development. The Littlefield and Csath collection contributes to the field in the manner of most conventional proceedings volumes: Motivated browsers and compulsive abstract scanners will discover a number of points of departure for more systematic, rigorous, and programmatic research. A regrettable lapse at the discourse analytic level is a reversion to the label "economic development," at the expense of the more accurate, eloquent, and comprehensive label "development," in the volume's title and section headings.

The volume is ambitious in scope. As if to emphasize this ambition, some of the most engaging (that is, thought-provoking or argumentative) contributions are contained in the introductory section, "Global Issues in Economic Development," and the concluding section, "Eclectic Issues in Development." For example, Sarin, Dholakia, and Dholakia provide an insightful and programmatic preview of impending scenarios from the Asian LDCs, while Goodrich considers some implications, but never the wisdom or neocolonial irony, of commercializing outer space. Fundamental issues are raised in articles on dual economies by Layton, on women in development by Firat and Lewis, and on historicism as a corrective to metatheoretical bias by Fullerton. Papers on topics such as AIDS (Nevett and Schleede), perestroika (Pascal), and aspects of channel management (Dunlap and Martin; Rosenbloom; Rudolph and Spalding) contain intriguing implications that are ill-suited for satisfactory exploration in conference paper format. What the reader might expect to be the linchpin section of the volume-a set of essays on the role of marketing and development---contains little material which is empirically or conceptually novel; this ground has been well traveled in the Kumcu and Firat book and its many secondary sources. A notable exception is the essay by Oumlil, Rao, and Balloun, which contains a list of provocative propositions (and implies others) that relate marketing to development and are in need of rigorous empirical investigation.

Focal area interests are variously served by the authors. Coverage is extended to topics such as government intervention, agricultural marketing, and technology transfer. Among these, several papers are noteworthy. Peperkemp provides a fascinating account of indigenous development in Sierra Leone. The article on market women in Senegal by Tansuhaj and McCullough is also a sound local level study. The appropriate technology movement is discussed by Dawson, and Samli and Grewal propose a detailed proactive program of technology transfer. The section on cultural aspects of marketing is uneven. Padmanabhan offers a substantially flawed but persuasive call for research into subcultures. Belk's view of consumer culture in LDCs is much more effectively presented in the Kumcu and Firat volume than it is here. Joy's contribution to the incipient literature on gender roles in marketing is laudable. Sections on consumer behavior, promotion and communication, and marketing research are of similarly discontinuous quality. Pollay's exhortation for empirical research into the effect of advertising on cultural change is solidly packed with practical suggestions. Clarke and others provide an interesting excursion into nonverbal communication without attempting linkage to development issues whatsoever. Watzke's content analysis of the promotional literature of national economic development agencies is resourceful and insightful. The few essays on ethics and social responsibility range from enlightened to ethnocentric; each is vastly underdeveloped in this conference paper format in proportion to its disciplinary and managerial significance.

The principal contribution of this volume resides in the sections dealing with specific industry and country cases in development. These sections are truly eclectic and sorely constrained by page limitation, but they suggest the breadth of scope and depth of detail required of scholarship in international marketing in general, and in development in particular, if these disciplines are to achieve maturity. Industries "examined" include financial services, generics, airlines, television programming, pacemakers, chemicals, tourism (the paper by Basu is especially welcome), and life insurance. Countries "explored" include Jamaica, Cyprus, India, Turkey, Colombia, Yugoslavia (The Yugo case by Aydin, Wheeler, and Marusic is well done), Hungary, Holland (Bamossy and others provide a country of origin study of exceptional promise), Brazil, and the Eastern European bloc (Goechle's piece on countertrade is useful). An entire section is devoted to the People's Republic of China.

The volume on production and autonomy edited by Bennett and Bowen could well have been compiled with the needs of radical macromarketers in mind. It also should be placed at the top of the extradisciplinary reading list of marketers interested in development. Largely a product of the 1985 conference of the Society for Economic Anthropology, the book is comprised of chapters which examine changes in local systems of production resulting from externally imposed and indigenously initiated development programs as well as the struggle over resources waged by local producers, governments, and foreign agencies. Contributors are drawn from such fields as anthropology, economics, political science, history, law, and sociology. Physically, the book is competently produced; it has a simple index, section precis, and useful notes on contributors, and it is reasonably free of typographical errors. Substantively, it is a fundamental contribution to the uneasy alliance forged between economics and anthropology, two of the disciplines from which development research most stands to benefit.

In his introductory essay, Bennett describes the moral dilemma faced by change agents and details a number of specifically anthropological models of directed intervention. He ascribes the hegemony of economistic thinking in development to the rise of nation states and the spread of capitalism, and he charges the "covert simplicities" accompanying such thinking with the counterproductive results of many development efforts. Anthropology is seen to provide a crucial brokerage function at the micro level by forcing development planners to attend to alternative strategies: "development from below," "participative development,""local autonomy." Two consequences of development programs worldwide-resource degradation and demographic instability-particularly concern Bennett. He challenges development researchers to devise an ideology that will "curb escalating wants" in developed nations and foster equitable distribution of "unevenly distributed resources." Implicit in this challenge is a plea for dedevelopment, along the lines of the demarketing once proposed by Kotler and Levy.

The volume is organized into four sections. The first provides overviews of competing perspectives of development and their attendant controversies. Adams examines development in long-term crosscultural, historical, and evolutionary perspective, with special attention to the relationship of regulatory power and energy utilization. Schneider proposes a list of development principles which can be instructively counterposed to those of Kotler. This list reflects the viewpoints of the Third World and embeds development in a meaningful political context. Bates stresses the ability of a contextually sensitive, process-oriented, and interdisciplinary approach to development.

Sections Two and Three are the empirical heart of the book. The former explores the sociocultural mediation of production; the latter examines the state and struggle for control. These sections are comprised principally of case studies drawn from around the world: West Africa, East Africa, Southeast Asia, Latin America, and North America are represented. In Section Two, channel efficiency (Saul), cash cropping (McCorkle), property rights (Berry), and migration (Galaty) are explored in local and supralocal perspective. Issues of increasing importance which have been slighted in research to date, such as the role of women in development (Berry), the significance of crime to the process of development (Truex), and the importance of the frontier to social reproduction (Moran, Gudeman), are considered in detail. Scherr offers a set of explicit guidelines for designing local-level research that can be incorporated directly into the analysis of aggregate economic behavior, thus facilitating the linkage of micro and macro concerns so critical to effective marketing interventions into development.

In Section Three, the political implications of development are explored in a number of chapters which examine the conflict and accommodation processes that obtain among local, regional, and national stakeholders bent upon controlling productive resources. Land redistribution (Crain), creation and management of service sectors (Salisbury), and cooperative resource management (Pinkerton) are specific issues employed to demonstrate community-level dynamics in participative development. Two chapters treating the informal economy, one by Russell on the politicization of food and its distribution, the other by Despres on self-employment as an adaptive career strategy, highlight the absolutely fundamental need for researchers and policy makers to understand marketplace behavior as an articulation of formal and

informal conduits, rather than as isolated activities occurring in discrete and parallel domains. Freeman provides an intriguing account of the meaning of irrigation water as it flows through the system from bureaucracies to farmers and ties this analysis to improving the design and operation of such systems. Coward examines the dynamics of property relations that are disturbed by cooptation of traditional irrigation systems by state governments bent upon modemization. Again, issues of coordination and control across stakeholders affected by development interventions raised by each of the authors in these sections are recognized as areas requiring much additional research. The ethnographic richness of these central chapters will provide much stimulation for macromarketers seeking to rethink their notions of externality.

Section Four is memorable for the impetus it provides for mounting a research regime into the culture of development itself. It is imperative that macromarketers undertake the study of institutions charged with the enormous responsibility of directed intervention into the lives of billions of consumers. The culture (or cult) of policy must be thoroughly understood so that it as well may be subject to sensitive and sensible intervention. Koenig describes the project culture and social organization of USAID interventions in West Africa. Scudder documents the history of the Institute for Development Anthropology and details the philosophy and methods espoused by the organization. The Land Tenure Center (University of Wisconsin) and some of its projects are described by Kanel and others in an essay that is especially sensitive to institutional politics. Each of these chapters is evaluative as well as descriptive, and each cultivates the kind of retrospective habit of mind macromarketers will require to improve the service delivery of institutions they aspire to influence.

While the concluding essay by Bowen is devoted to discovering the disciplinary significance to anthropology of development studies, it offers an honest and accurate interpretive summary of the authors' contributions. The reader might well begin the book with this chapter and would benefit from a rereading upon completion of each of the book's major sections. Bowen calls for development studies that are comparative, that examine institutions linking local and national levels, and that include processes of at least medium term. An anthropological approach to development is suited to this task. What anthropologists do best, observes Bowen, is "study how, in a particular place and time, people experience the prospects and plans that are decided upon elsewhere."

Each of the four volumes discussed in this essay attests to the need for a careful and thoroughgoing

rethinking of the process of development. Each is laden with cautionary tales and admonitions that should jostle macromarketers' intellectual comfort zones enough to prompt a reintegration of existing literature on marketing and development and a more systematic exploration of contiguous disciplines. It is hoped they will encourage scholars to seek out perspectives directly from stakeholders in so-called developing societies and promote a genuine dialogue among the "worlds" that are transforming the global system. Clearly, our ability to change the world outstrips our ability to understand it (Ornstein and Ehrlich 1989). That a development equivalent of Ricks' (1983) Big Business Blunders could be written is apparent. That those blunders could be rectified as efficiently or dispassionately is impossible. The search for new vocabularies with which to humanize development can begin with these volumes. Researchers will find numerous points of departure for further contributions in these pages. Seminar leaders might easily incorporate these volumes or, more likely, chapters from each of them into graduate courses on macromarketing, international marketing, strategic marketing, policy and environment, and quite conceivably new product design. A definitive text on marketing and development remains to be written, but many of its source materials are here.

John F. Sherry, Jr. Northwestern University

REFERENCES

- Adler, Nancy, Nigel Campbell, and Andre Laurent (1989), "In Search of Appropriate Methodology: From Outside the People's Republic of China Looking In," Journal of International Business Studies, 20 (1), 61-74.
- DeSoto, Hernando (1989), The Other Path, New York: Harper and Row.
- Escobar, Arturo (1988), "Power and Visibility: Development and the Invention and Management of the Third World," Cultural Anthropology, 3 (4), 428-43.
- Godzich, Wlad (1985), "The Semiotics of Semiotics," in On Signs, ed. Marshall Blonsky, Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 421-47.
- Klamer, Arjo, Donald McCloskey, and Robert Solow, eds. (1988), The Consequences of Economic Rhetoric, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Levitt, Theodore (1983), "The Globalization of Markets," Harvard Business Review, 61 (3), 92-102.
- _____ (1988), "The Pluralization of Consumption," Harward Business Review, 66 (3), 7-8.
- Ornstein, Robert and Paul Ehrlich (1989), New World, New Mind, New York: Doubleday.
- Ricks, David (1983), Big Business Blunders, Homewood, IL: Irwin.
- Sherry, John (1989), "Postmodern Alternatives: The Interpretive Turn in Consumer Research," in *Handbook of Consumer Theory and Research*, eds. Harold Kassarjian and Thomas Robertson, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall. Forthcoming.

AGRICULTURAL MARKETING POLICY

Collected by Dieter Elz and Caroline Hoisington (Washington, D.C.: Economic Development Institute (EDI) of the World Bank, 1986)

The two volumes contain 15 reprints and one especially commissioned to jort that were assembled as background reading for the first Agricultural Marketing Policy seminar. The event was sponsored by the Economic Development Institute (EDI) of the World Bank and held during May 6-17, 1985, in Washington, D.C. Nine of the papers were written by World Bank staff or consultants. Both volumes are available from the World Bank Book Store, 1818 H Street, N.W., in Washington, D.C. 20433.

The purposes of this review are to present vignettes on individual papers and to make some suggestions about easing access to the excellent macromarketing material.

David Jones, Ford Foundation, analyzes the performance of the centralized agricultural marketing systems that have been established by African states since independence. He maintains that central governments should not do marketing of agricultural products because they are "very bad at it and without monopoly position most of them would not last 24 hours." He then destroys the "seven myths" about why direct government performance of marketing functions is necessary. Jones does not suggest any specific action or government policy.

Louis Bucklin, University of California at Berkeley, explores marketing productivity and food distribution in Asian countries. He defines marketing outputs and inputs; shows how to measure productivity for wholesaling, iabor, capital, merchandise, and food retailing; and outlines policies aimed at furthering productivity improvement. This superb think piece unfortunately is devoid of illustrative examples.

Walter P. Falcon and Scott R. Pearson, Stanford Food Research Institute (SFRI), joined hands with Peter C. Timmer, Harvard University Graduate School

JOURNAL OF MACROMARKETING 71