

Sample reconstructions of Hume's argument

PHIL 13185

Jeff Speaks

January 22, 2007

Each of these reconstructions of Hume's argument has part of the argument right, but could be improved. How would you modify these arguments to make them stronger?

I

1. If God exists, then God would be all good and all powerful, and would be willing and able to prevent any evil from happening, in which case there would be no evil.
 2. Evil exists.
-
- C. God does not exist.

II

1. God is not willing to prevent evil.
 2. God is not able to prevent evil.
 3. If God exists, then he would be willing and able to prevent evil.
-
- C. God does not exist.

III

1. If God could prevent a certain evil, then he would.
 2. There is evil in the world.
-
- C. God does not exist.

IV

1. If God is willing to prevent evil, but not able, then God is impotent.
 2. If God is able to prevent evil, but not willing, then God is malevolent.
-
- C. God's ways are a mystery.

V

1. If God exists, then God would prevent any evil from existing.
 2. There is evil.
-
- C. God does not exist.

VI

1. God is omnipotent (all powerful).
 2. God is omnibenevolent (all good).
 3. If God exists, then evil does not exist.
 4. Evil does exist.
-
- C. God does not exist.