

THE FAILURE OF MODERNISM

The Cartesian Legacy and Contemporary Pluralism

American Maritain Association Publications

General Editor: Anthony O. Simon

Jacques Maritain: The Man and His Metaphysics

Edited by John F. X. Knasas, 1988

★ ISBN 0-268-01205-9 (out of print)

*Freedom in the Modern World: Jacques Maritain, Yves R. Simon,
Mortimer J. Adler*

Edited by Michael D. Torre, 1989, Second Printing 1990

★ ISBN 0-268-00978-3

From Twilight to Dawn: The Cultural Vision of Jacques Maritain

Edited by Peter A. Redpath, 1990

★ ISBN 0-268-00979-1

The Future of Thomism

Edited by Deal W. Hudson and Dennis Wm. Moran, 1992

★ ISBN 0-268-00986-4

Jacques Maritain and the Jews

Edited by Robert Royal, 1994

★ ISBN 0-268-01193-1

Freedom, Virtue, and the Common Good

Edited by Curtis L. Hancock and Anthony O. Simon, 1995

★ ISBN 0-268-00991-0

Postmodernism and Christian Philosophy

Edited by Roman T. Ciapalo, 1997

◆ ISBN 0-8132-0881-5

The Common Things: Essays on Thomism and Education

Edited by Daniel McInerney, 1998

◆ ISBN 0-9669226-0-3

The Failure of Modernism: The Cartesian Legacy and Contemporary Pluralism

Edited by Brendan Sweetman, 1999

◆ ISBN 0-9669226-1-1

★ Distributed by the University of Notre Dame Press

◆ Distributed by The Catholic University of America Press

THE FAILURE
OF MODERNISM

*The Cartesian Legacy
and Contemporary Pluralism*

Edited by

Brendan Sweetman

Rockhurst University

American Maritain Association

Copyright © 1999

American Maritain Association

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The failure of modernism : the Cartesian legacy and contemporary pluralism /
edited by Brendan Sweetman.

p. cm. — (American Maritain Association publications)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-9669226-1-1

1. Philosophy, Modern. 2. Descartes, René, 1596-1650.

3. Maritain, Jacques, 1882-1973.

I. Sweetman, Brendan. II. Series.

B791.F355 1999

149'.91—DC21

98-74541

CIP

Manufactured in the
United States of America

American Maritain Association
Anthony O. Simon, Secretary
508 Travers Circle
Mishawaka, Indiana 46545

Distributed by The Catholic University of America Press
Washington, D.C. 20064

To Brendan, John and Ciaran

Acknowledgments

Many people generously assisted me at various stages in the preparation of this book, and I am very grateful to all of them. Without them, there would be no book. (Despite what some people today seem to believe, nothing “pops into existence,” especially not books!)

I am especially grateful to Curtis Hancock, Anthony O. Simon, and Roman Ciapalo for their advice and unfailing support. Tony Simon, Doug Geivett and Ted Furton read various portions of the manuscript and offered valuable suggestions. I am also grateful to the staff at the Catholic University of America Press for their courteous and professional assistance, especially Director David McGonagle, and Ms. Marguerite Leonard and Ms. Beth Benevides.

I would also like to thank all of the contributors to the volume for their excellent essays, for their prompt editorial work and for their overall enthusiasm for and commitment to the intellectual life. They are a dedicated group of teachers and scholars who are an inspiration to many, and I am very grateful for the privilege to work with them.

Several people at Rockhurst University ensured that I had released time to work on the volume; I would like to mention in particular Teresa Reed and Corey Simmonds. I also wish to acknowledge Rockhurst University for a Presidential grant to support my work on portions of the book.

I owe a very special word of thanks to Jonathan Raymon, a philosophy graduate of Loras College, who designed the cover for the volume, and prepared the camera-ready copy with great skill and professionalism. Without Jonathan's help, this volume would still be in the realm of conceptual knowledge.

Finally, my biggest debt of gratitude is to my wife Margaret, and my sons, Brendan, John and Ciaran, for their great support and encouragement, without which this book would not have been possible. My three boys have philosophically established to my satisfaction that it is possible to prepare and print manuscripts in almost total bedlam! This book is dedicated to them.

Contents

INTRODUCTION

| | | |
|----|---|----|
| | <i>The Failure of Modernism</i> Brendan Sweetman | 1 |
| 1. | <i>Why Descartes was not a Philosopher</i> Peter A. Redpath | 10 |
| 2. | <i>Descartes's Res: An Interactionist Difficulty</i> Robert Geis | 22 |
| 3. | <i>Descartes, Mathematics and Music</i> Donald DeMarco | 35 |
| 4. | <i>Maximum Influence from Minimum Abilities: La Mettrie and Radical Materialism</i> William J. Fossati | 45 |
| 5. | <i>On the Aristotelian Heritage of John of Damascus</i> Joseph Koterski, S.J. | 58 |
| 6. | <i>Transcendental Thomism: Realism Rejected</i> Christopher M. Cullen, S.J. | 72 |
| 7. | <i>Was Maritain a Crypto-Machiavellian?</i> James V. Schall, S.J. | 87 |

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 8. | <i>Richard Hooker as Source of the Founding Principles of American Natural Law</i> Edward Furton | 101 |
| 9. | <i>Neutral Frameworks, the Rule of Law and the Common Good</i> Terry Hall | 110 |
| 10. | <i>Jacques Maritain and Alasdair MacIntyre: The Person, the Common Good and Human Rights</i> Deborah Wallace | 127 |
| 11. | <i>Jacques Maritain, Thomism and the Liberal-Communitarian Debate</i> Michael Moreland | 141 |
| 12. | <i>On the Purpose of the State: Continuity and Change in Political Theories</i> Henk E. S. Woldring | 155 |
| 13. | <i>Transcending Right and Left: A Question of Virtue</i> James G. Hanink | 171 |
| 14. | <i>Jacques Maritain, Heroic Humanism and the Gospel</i> John X. Evans | 179 |
| 15. | <i>Deconstruction, Onto-Theology and Thomas's Via Negativa</i> Matthew Pugh | 199 |
| 16. | <i>The Postmodern Notion of Freedom and Aquinas's Ratio Entis</i> John F. X. Knasas | 212 |

| | | |
|--------------|--|-----|
| 17. | <i>The Pseudo-Problem of Skepticism</i> | |
| | Brendan Sweetman | 228 |
| 18. | <i>A Critique of Social Construct Theory</i> | |
| | Curtis L. Hancock | 242 |
| EPILOGUE | | |
| | <i>A Counterfeit Choice</i> | |
| | Curtis L. Hancock | 259 |
| CONTRIBUTORS | | 263 |
| INDEX | | 267 |