How Macro-historical Change Shapes Cultural Taste: Legacies of Democratization in Spain and Portugal[1]

Robert M. Fishman
Kellogg Institute for International Studies
Kellogg Institute for International Studies, 130 Hesburgh Center, Notre Dame, IN, 46556
Email: robertmfishman@gmail.com
Tel: 574-631-8531

Omar Lizardo
University of Notre Dame
Department of Sociology, University of Notre Dame, 810 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, IN, 46556
Email: olizardo@nd.edu
Tel: 574-631-1855

Keywords: Cultural Taste, Omnivores, Democratization, Education, Institutional Practices.

Abstract

In this paper, we show that large-scale macro-political change can powerfully condition the way that institutional practices shape individual cultural choice. We study the paired comparison of Portugal and Spain, two long-similar societies that moved from authoritarianism to democracy through divergent pathways in the 1970s. Data from the 2001 Eurobarometer indicate that while the cultural choices of persons born *before* democratic transition are comparable across the two cases, Portuguese youth born under democracy are substantially more omnivorous than their Spanish counterparts. We shed light on this puzzle through a structured, focused comparison. Our argument is that whereas revolution in Portugal overturned hierarchies in numerous social institutions and unleashed an ambitious program of cultural transformation, the consensus-oriented transition of Spain was largely limited to remaking political institutions. We show that this macro-political divergence has resulted in a key cross-case difference at the institutional level. Whereas pedagogical practices in Portugal encourage young people to adopt the post-canonical, anti-hierarchical orientation towards aesthetics constitutive of the omnivorous orientation, the corresponding practices in Spain restrict omnivorousness by instilling a hierarchical, largely canonical attitude towards cultural works.

1.   Introduction

Cultural taste may appear as one of the strongest marks of human individuality, yet the most consistent finding in the sociology of taste is that social position systematically shapes cultural preferences (Bourdieu1984; van Eijck 2001; Katz-Gerro 2004).   In this paper, we show that case-specific macro-historical processes are capable of powerfully influencing *how*—and *how much*—social position shapes cultural choices, identifying educational institutions and pedagogical practice as a crucial intermediate arena linking macro-political change to the dynamics of taste acquisition at the individual level (DiMaggio 1991; Lizardo 2008). We do so by examining how a crucial historical turning point generated a substantial difference between cultural consumption patterns in Portugal and Spain, two long-similar countries that experienced divergent democratic transitions in the 1970s. We show that the polar opposite roads to democracy of the Iberian Peninsula neighbors led to non-hierarchical educational institutions and practices in one case and relatively hierarchical ones in the other and that this contrast, in turn, generated a large cross-national disparity in the cultural tastes of youth.

Putting cultural omnivorousness in context

We focus on the most well documented empirical generalization in the sociology of cultural taste – the connection between markers of social status and the tendency to make either narrow (boundary-drawing) or broad (boundary-crossing) cultural consumption choices. Contemporary scholars conceptualize these opposing patterns of aesthetic consumption as constituting a distinction between "univores" and "omnivores," respectively (Peterson 1992). Scores of studies show that educated and professional strata are more likely than those of low status to make diverse, or "omnivorous", aesthetic choices, that cross boundaries such as the divide between opera and rap music, to take but one example (Peterson 2005, Katz-Gerro 2004). This phenomenon, first detected in the United States in a classic series of studies (e.g. Peterson and Kern 1996), appears to be characteristic of every rich Western country that has fielded an arts participation survey (Virtanen 2007). The cross-national generality of this finding is one of the primary motivations for our study, for we seek to identify and theorize mechanisms driving

variation (and similarity) among national cases. In what follows, we shed light on the processes linking educational institutions and omnivore taste while asking what this much-replicated finding tells us about the underlying linkage between case-specific macro-societal processes and individual cultural preferences.

Major weaknesses of the literature on cultural omnivorousness concern the relative neglect of the *generative mechanisms* underpinning the phenomenon (Lizardo and Skiles 2012) and, as a result, the lack of attention to the (macro to micro) *linkage* between institutional context and individual patterns of cultural choice. There has been no systematic examination of whether the production of omnivorous taste publics is *contingent* on processes embedded in structured, *case-specific* configurations of institutional practices, themselves the product of historical trajectories. In this paper, we address this gap in the study of culture and stratification while also contributing to the growing comparative literature on the cultural and social consequences of historical processes of macro-political change. Our primary aim is to trace the mechanisms through which cross-national variation in macro-historical change differentially reshapes the impact of social institutions on the acquisition of cultural orientations.

To accomplish these objectives, we make use of a methodological strategy combining quantitative survey data analysis with the qualitative paired-comparison (Tarrow 2010) of two carefully chosen national cases, the Iberian Peninsula neighbors of Portugal and Spain. These historically similar, geographically proximate countries moved to democracy through opposite pathways in the mid-1970s. Because these societies experienced fundamentally dissimilar historical *turning points* (Abbott 2001: 252), their comparison is particularly relevant to the question at hand. We pair these cases in order to examine whether divergent historical trajectories can reshape within-country causal processes linking institutions and collective actors to patterns of cultural choice (DiMaggio 1991; Katz-Gerro 2002).[1]

A key implication of this study is that research on cultural consumption can benefit from case-sensitive methodologies that explore the macro-level interplay of processes at work in the political, social and cultural spheres, a strategy that has paid-off handsomely in

other areas of research (e.g. Hall and Lamont, 2009). One important advantage of our approach lies in its capacity to demonstrate explicitly how some of the key causal dynamics (e.g. linking status to cultural taste) that analysts have conceptualized as operating independently of context are actually contingent on historically embedded societal configurations (Bourdieu 1991; Griffin et al 1991; Ragin 2008).

On the absence of case-oriented logic in the sociology of taste

Contemporary work on the cultural taste/stratification linkage rests on a methodological premise that is open to question: the assumption that causal processes operate in a largely *case-free* manner (but see Peterson 2005 for a plea to engage in case-based comparative analysis). This work sometimes seeks to identify general theoretical implications of empirical patterns observed in *one national setting* —usually the United States (see in particular, DiMaggio 1991; also Bryson 1996; Peterson and Kern 1996; Griswold and Wright 2004; Lopez Sintas and Katz-Gerro 2005)—which is taken as emblematic of case-transcending tendencies. Even work that attempts to specify the explanatory impact of *cross-national variation* in structures, institutions and individual competencies theorized to shape tastes and consumption patterns retains the fundamental assumption that causal processes operate similarly across national cases.

Within that methodological framework, there is a lively tradition of survey-based work on multiple countries (e.g. Lambert, Bergman and Prandy 2005; Katz-Gerro 2002, 2006; De Graaf 1991; Kraaykamp and Nieuwbeerta 2000) as well as in-depth, multi-method, single-country studies outside of the U.S. (e.g. Bennett et al 2009). This research establishes that the dynamic connecting high-status markers, such as educational or occupational attainment, to either omnivore or so-called "highbrow" taste manifest itself across quite diverse national contexts. Nevertheless, the generalizability of these findings across national cases remains tied— in the studies cited above—to *ad hoc* comparative designs, in which issues of (survey) data availability rather than theoretical or methodological considerations dictate *which* cases serve as the basis for comparison.

Such scholarship typically relies on what Charles Ragin (2008) refers to as *variable-oriented* design; researchers seek to ascertain the "net" effect of a set of independent

variables on a given dependent variable in the countries – or other units of analysis – under study. This implicitly assumes that complex case histories leave unaltered the cross-case causal impact of independent variables. In this paper, we adopt a different analytic approach. We conduct a strategic comparison of two cases characterized by numerous structural and historical similarities alongside several crucial differences of direct theoretical relevance for our purposes. The comparison of these same two cases has attracted the interest of social scientists in a variety of disciplines.[2]

2. The Portugal and Spain Comparison as a Strategic Research Site

The historical and structural similarities of the Iberian neighbors are quite striking. Their developmental parallels, and record of mutual influence through cross-border diffusion, extend backward in history to their early modern role in pioneering the European colonization of the globe (Modelski and Thompson 1996: 233) and their nearly contemporaneous expulsion of Jews and Muslims. Following the weak but resilient emergence of liberalism in the nineteenth century, ambitious but contested republics replaced monarchy in both countries in the early twentieth century (Linz 1979; Schwartzman 1989). In both cases, right-wing authoritarians subsequently overthrew these republics, inaugurating repressive regimes that would last until the mid-1970s (Linz and Stepan 1996).[3] Both were late economic developers in the west European context with large agricultural sectors employing much of the labor force (until relatively late in the twentieth century) and focused on the cultivation of a similar mix of crops. Land tenure patterns varied from tiny owner-cultivated farms in the north to large estates worked classically by day laborers in the South. Both economies experienced rapid growth accompanied by intense urban expansion in the 1960s and early 1970s.

The democratic transitions as turning point

The parallelism of the two cases was broken with their highly dissimilar paths to democracy in the 1970s. We argue that this historical turning point induced broad divergence between the cases. Portugal moved to democracy through a process of social revolution rooted in a classic pattern of "state crisis" (Skocpol 1979), and Spain through a

consensus-oriented transformation led by reformers within both the prior regime and its democratic opposition (Fishman 1990a). Portugal's revolutionary path to democracy quickly induced a major transformation of social structure encompassing not only the nationalization of much of the economy but also a partial *inversion of hierarchies* in numerous institutions, including government ministries, schools, and the news media. This was accompanied by a recasting of cultural processes – including ways of defining and transmitting national identity (Fishman 2011). This pattern of change was vastly different from that of Spain where the consensus-oriented regime transition was largely limited to a remaking of political institutions, leaving other spheres (e.g. educational institutions) relatively untouched. The cross-case consequences of these divergent democratization paths are today manifested both in formal institutions – e.g. in the extraordinarily broad inclusion of social rights in the Portuguese Constitution (Vieira and Silva, 2010; Magalhaes, forthcoming) – *and* in informal social practices that govern routine action in civil society.

Outline of the Argument

Our main causal claim is that institutional features and forms of practice linked to these sharply different pathways to democracy – and manifested within the contemporary educational systems – have resulted in the relative flourishing of the omnivorous cultural disposition among youth in Portugal and its comparative underdevelopment in Spain. We do not intend to argue that *all* social dynamics underpinning the acquisition of omnivorous cultural tastes are embedded in nationally specific histories. Scholars have often assumed that much of the dynamic leading to expansive tastes is broadly transnational and tends to diffuse across national borders (Johnston and Baumann 2007). Our claim is that nationally specific configurations and forms of practice can substantially intensify or diminish the strength with which institutional actors assimilate, elaborate, and transmit such transnational cultural currents.

Our argument elaborates the view that *political* and *aesthetic* practices, dispositions and trajectories co-evolve or at the very least are subject to similar influences (Bourdieu 1984: 451-453). From this perspective, cultural omnivorousness is constituted via the application of values of multicultural tolerance and liberal anti-authoritarianism to

aesthetic choices (Bryson 1996; DiMaggio 1996; Ollivier 2008). This hypothesis is congruent with the long line of empirical research showing that tolerant or "inclusivist" patterns of cultural choice have an elective affinity with tolerant and inclusivist political values and attitudes (van Eijck and Lievens 2008; Elchardus and Siongers 2007). As Ollivier (2008) has suggested, omnivorousness is tied to specific orientations towards politics and culture that value an "openness to diversity" as well as their associated relational configurations (DiMaggio 1987);[4] such dispositions include an orientation towards "world culture" (Lizardo 2005). This *theoretical and substantive* linkage between omnivorousness and *anti-hierarchical inclusivism*, or broad "humanism" provides the rationale for our focus on the omnivore taste patterns (and not other forms of taste) in what follows.

3.   Generations and patterns of cultural choice in Portugal and Spain

We begin by establishing the cross-case contrast in cultural omnivorousness among post-transition cohorts. Here we rely on micro-level data on culture consumption habits of EU citizens from the August-September 2001 Eurobarometer (Christensen 2003). This Eurobarometer (N=16,200) included a special module on participation in a wide variety of cultural activities, from mass media (radio and television) to music and the arts. Although our argument rests on a broad concern for cross-national variation in cultural tastes, we focus here on this strategically paired comparison (Tarrow, 2010) because of its ability to highlight causal dynamics rooted in macro-historical processes of change.

Our total sample consists of 2,000 respondents, 1,000 for each of the two countries. Each respondent in the survey was asked the following question: What kind of music do you listen to? Responses were organized into 11 broad musical categories, or genres: 1) rock and roll and pop rock, 2) heavy metal or hard rock, 3) easy listening, 4) electronic dance music or "house," 5) techno or ambient, 6) rap or hip hop, 7), folk or traditional music (including American country music), 8) jazz and blues, and 9) world music, 10) classical music and 11) opera. A respondent is assigned a value of one on each dichotomous indicator if s/he reports having listened to a live or recorded performance of the genre at least once in the past month.

We create a simple omnivorousness scale by "volume" (Warde and Gayo-Cal 2009), adding the musical genres consumed for each respondent.[5] We do not argue that this linear scale captures *all* possible dimensions of the omnivorousness phenomenon (which entails more than simply the quantity of genres chosen). We use the simple linear measurement for two reasons. First, recent research shows that omnivorousness by volume has good criterion validity: it correlates very well with other socio-demographic and cultural behavior markers thought to be distinctive of this class of consumers and is a good predictor of the socio-political orientations characteristic of omnivores (Lizardo 2005, Elchardus and Siongers 2007; Warde and Gayo-Cal 2009). Second, while the use of additive scales to measure omnivorousness has been criticized on methodological grounds (Peterson 2005), our own experimentation with typologies derived from the data using more complex methodologies does not result in substantively different findings. We adopt the simple additive scale because the results generated are substantially easier to interpret and present than the alternative and very little if any underlying connection to the phenomenon of interest is lost through this approach.

We rely on items covering musical (and not other) forms of taste for several reasons. First, music has been the realm where omnivorousness has been most thoroughly investigated; choosing this focus provides continuity with the bulk of previous research. Second, arts participations surveys and qualitative studies show that music is the most widespread culture consumption activity (Bennett et al 2009; deNora 2000) and that at the same time (in contrast to television viewing) it shows strong patterns of historical and social differentiation by musical genre (Lena and Peterson 2008). Music listening thus strikes closer than other cultural practices to "taste" and limits the possible confusion of an individual's preferences with the impact of exogenous factors reflective of cultural access, leisure time and material resources. Third, both classic (e.g. Bourdieu 1984) and more recent studies (e.g. Bryson 1996; Bennett et al 2009) find that music *is* a distinctive realm of cultural taste, in which the linkage between the degree of cultural openness (i.e. among 'omnivores' who like several genres) and analogous attitudes in other domains (e.g. politics or values) can be clearly observed (Bryson 1996). As Bennett et al (2009: 75) conclude in their recent major study of the cultural habits and practices of the British public: "music is

the most clearly separated of all our cultural fields...it is the most divided, contentious cultural field of any that we [have] examine[d]."

Cross-national differences within generations

Cross-case differences in expected omnivorousness within generations. - We begin by examining whether systematic differences exist between the two national cases in the prevalence of cultural omnivorousness within age cohorts. Our theoretical perspective emphasizes the enduring impact of large historical turning points, such as the divergent democratization scenarios of the Iberian neighbors in the 1970s. Accordingly, we expect that cultural omnivorousness should vary by country among respondents born *after* the transitions, but not among those belonging to cohorts that reached adulthood and developed cultural tastes prior to the 1970s regime transitions, although some effects of the transitions could also emerge among individuals who were acquiring musical tastes in the historical context of democratization. Our theoretical perspective also allows us to make predictions on the direction of this generational variation. The revolutionary nature of the Portuguese road to democracy led to a situation in which hierarchies of all sorts, including aesthetic ones, came into question from an egalitarian perspective.[6] The Spanish transition, in contrast, tended to promote a broad consensus that discouraged potentially polarizing endeavors—such as the fundamental questioning of hierarchies. We should thus expect to observe a relative advantage of Portuguese youth over their Spanish counterparts in the expansiveness of their cultural preferences and underlying aesthetic tolerance.

Figure 1 presents results strongly consistent with these expectations. The vertical axis in each of the panels is the mean score for each cohort on the omnivore scale. Each panel presents the expected score on the omnivorousness scale for members of that cohort across the two national cases. The marker identifies the estimated mean score for that cohort and the vertical line is the 90% confidence interval; these are estimated from a Poisson regression equation with the number of genres chosen by each respondent as the dependent variable. In generating these predicted means, we control for respondents' gender, level of education (coded in three categories: primary, secondary and university as detailed below), marital status (married or not married), frequency of music listening

(frequent listeners versus abstainers) and the urban/rural status of the town of residence. The cross-national difference between the estimates that we report for Portugal and Spain, the *country effect*, is calculated controlling for any compositional effect produced by these factors. Table 1 shows the (robust) standard errors and coefficient estimates associated with the country effect for each age group.

A note of caution on interpreting the results shown in figure 1: Our methodology is intended to establish contrasts *between* the two countries for members of each age cohort but does not provide an adequate basis to interpret the differences between age cohorts *within* either country. In the absence of panel data we cannot draw firm conclusions about within-country differences across age groups since observed differences reflect an unknown amalgam of age, cohort (and possibly but least likely) period effects. Thus, it would be questionable to interpret the age/cohort differences as specifying within-country *trends* because differences across age cohorts could reflect average age-effects in cultural engagement (e.g. the fact that older people are less culturally active or are less familiar with novel musical genres than young people) rather than historically embedded cohort effects. Thus, we focus our interpretations on the country effect *within* age groups (e.g. cross-national differences within panels) and not on within country contrasts *across* age/cohort groups**.**

The figure clearly shows that the country effect is null—as reflected by the overlapping confidence intervals—for members of cohorts born *before* democracy but that a substantial country effect emerges for cohorts born *after* democratization took place. Respondents born before 1962, and thus at least partially socialized in musical consumption prior to the return of democracy, are virtually indistinguishable between the two countries. Respondents born between 1962 and 1976 appear marginally different (but still statistically indistinguishable) between the cases. Respondents born under democracy (1977 or later), on the other hand, are substantially different on the two sides of the Iberian border. This indicates that there is no uniform cross-national difference in breadth of cultural engagement, but that Portuguese youth are distinct from their Spanish counterparts, whereas middle-aged and older adults are essentially the same across the

two cases. The substantially higher level of omnivorousness among Portuguese youth seems especially surprising from the standpoint of conventional accounts of the macro-social correlates of this phenomenon (e.g. Peterson and Kern 1996), since Spain outperforms Portugal in standard measures of economic development and educational expansion. In the Portuguese case, the expansion of educational access is a more recent development (Candeias, et. al. 2007; Vieira, 2007).

We sought to determine how distinctive the Iberian pattern – of divergence in the post-1977 cohort – is by contrasting this two-case pairing with other sets of longtime (more or less) similar countries: We examined the pattern manifested by Denmark and Sweden, Germany and Austria, Belgium and the Netherlands, the United Kingdom and Ireland, as well as Greece and Italy.[7] The data show that *none* of these pairings shared the pattern evidenced by the Iberian Peninsula neighbors, namely that of comparable breadth in the number of cultural choices in the older cohorts giving way to a strong divergence in the youngest cohort. The Belgium-Netherlands pairing manifested the reverse pattern: differentiation in the older cohorts yielding to similarity – and no "country-effect" – in the youngest cohort. The Portugal-Spain pairing stands out as quite distinctive when compared to other obvious two-way pairings in the European data. This makes this dyad a strategic research site for shedding light on how an instance of macro-political *divergence* can reshape national processes of cultural taste acquisition.

Cross-case differences in the distribution of number of choices within generations. - In this section, we present an analysis of cross-case differences in the full distribution of number of musical genres chosen; we examine the score for our dependent variable for each of our four generational groups. This analysis allows to us to identify patterns not revealed by the average difference of about one genre among persons born under democracy. The results are shown in Figure 2. The univariate distribution of number of genres chosen is very similar across our two cases for the pre-democracy cohorts, suggesting that (at least for these groups) it was appropriate to rely on mean differences. However, for persons born under democracy we see a substantial divergence between the two cases and, as the approach taken in Figure 2 shows, that cross-national difference is

manifested at all points in the distribution of musical genres chosen. Whereas about one fifth (20%) of Portuguese born under democracy are univores, restricting themselves to only one genre, this figure is 34% in the Spanish case (a comparable cross-national gap exists when it comes to persons who choose only two genres, 19% versus 28%). By contrast, the number of Portuguese who choose multiple genres is consistently higher than in Spain for all values of three or above.

We performed a Mann-Whitney test to evaluate the (null) hypothesis that the two national distributions come from the same underlying population for each generational group (Mann and Whitney 1947).This test fails to reject the null hypothesis for all three generational groups born before transition ($p > 0.05$), confirming the impression provided by a visual inspection of figure 2. However for the cohort born under democracy, the Mann-Whitney test decisively rejects the null hypothesis that the two distributions come from the same population ($|z| = 5.01$, $p < 0.01$), establishing a strong basis for our claim of a 'country effect' in the youngest cohort. This is an important substantive finding, lending credence to the argument that before democracy the populations of the Iberian cases represent comparable samples, at least for the criterion under consideration here (number of cultural choices), and that for strict statistical purposes they could theoretically be pooled. However, this is not the case among younger cohorts, who represent two nationally distinct populations in terms of their cultural behavior.

Cross-case differences in expected omnivorousness between educational groups within generations.- Our data – and this study's comparative design – allow us to examine whether schooling induces systematically different effects on members of the post-transition cohort in the two cases when we examine how given levels of educational attainment impact the cultural dispositions reflected by the number of musical genres 'consumed'. If our argument is well founded, schooling after democratization should have a more culturally liberating effect in our post-revolutionary case, Portugal, than in Spain, where institutional change was substantially more restrained.

The only measure of schooling available in the Eurobarometer survey is an indirect one: the respondent reports the age at which he or she "stopped full-time education"

(Christensen et al 2003: 22). For students who are still in school this variable is thus the same as their biological age. We assign the following qualitative cutoffs to this education indicator: A respondent who reported having stopped education at the age of 15 or earlier (or who was 15 at the time of the survey but still in school) is considered to have received a *primary* level of schooling. We consider those respondents who reported having stopped their full time education between the ages of 16 and 19, or who were within that age group at the time of the survey and still in school, to have received *secondary* level schooling (roughly equivalent to high school). Finally, respondents who reported stopping their education at or after the age of 20, or who were of that age at the time of the survey but still in school, are considered to have received (at least some) *post-secondary* schooling.

Figure 3 provides evidence that the effect of education differs systematically between the two cases, and that this contrast is manifested precisely among the youngest respondents schooled in the two very different democratic contexts. The key comparison pertains to the difference between those who are currently in high school (or stopped their schooling at that level) indicated by the black circle versus those who received only a primary education, indicated by the white circle. The figure reproduces the basic result shown in Figure 1 (null cross-national differences for persons born pre-transition). The panel corresponding to the post-transition cohort reveals one important new finding: Spaniards exposed to secondary education are not (statistically) distinguishable—in their propensity towards omnivorousness—from their counterparts who received only primary schooling. In Portugal in contrast, receiving some form of secondary education under democracy generates a substantively and statistically significant enhancement of cultural activation. As shown in the second and third panel (displaying the same results for the cohorts born prior to or during the transition to democracy) this activation effect of secondary education is absent for two older Portuguese cohorts, suggesting that this phenomenon is not a consistent primordial characteristic of the Portuguese educational system.

Summary. - The central empirical puzzle posed by our analysis of the Eurobarometer data concerns the divergence between two previously quite similar countries in the effect

of high school education on cultural omnivorousness. After the Iberian countries' dissimilar pathways to democracy in the 1970s, the impact of high school education diverges sharply. High school studies exert a taste-expanding effect far greater in Portugal's post-revolutionary democracy than under democracy in Spain or in either country under authoritarian rule. We rely on a qualitative case-oriented methodology to locate the mechanisms that can account for this contrast.

Unpacking the Puzzle: A Case-Based Strategy

Our goal is to look beyond the average and distributional differences established by the survey data. In particular, we seek to specify the *causal processes* that account for the post-democratization cross-case contrast. The most striking finding thus far is that the disparity in omnivorous taste between the two countries is almost entirely concentrated among young people born under democracy. Those socialized prior to democratization are statistically indistinguishable across the national settings. This pattern of results, coupled with our systematic paired comparison design, provides us with analytic leverage useful for causal inference (Brady and Collier 2010), leaving us in a position to rule out some initially appealing but now less credible alternative explanations. Crucially, these findings undercut any account of taste-formation that searches for causal dynamics rooted in *constant* or *essentialist* differences between our cases – such as the presence of regional-nationalist minorities in Spain juxtaposed against the unitary national identity of the Portuguese – or any factor embedded in the distant past of both countries. Our findings also undercut an explanatory recourse to hypothesized causal dynamics that could be expected to produce an impact on members of all age cohorts – as in the case of national economic performance, social policy regimes, or patterns of income inequality.

The cohort-specific differences among those born under democracy *are* consistent with an explanation rooted in more temporally proximate causes capable of reshaping prior case trajectories; such causal factors are highlighted in historical approaches to explanation that emphasize over-time contingency and path-dependence (Abbott 2001; Mahoney and Rueschemeyer 2003; Pierson 2004; Isaac 1997). One finding discussed above helps to focus our search for an explanatory account: Portuguese youth exposed to high

school education are considerably more omnivorous than their Spanish counterparts. Thus, in spite of the fact that Portugal is a somewhat later developer and a poorer society than Spain, in their cultural choice patterns Portuguese youth (but not their older counterparts) are more similar to their peers in the prosperous and socially advanced societies of northern Europe than to their Southern European counterparts.[8] How and why a relatively poor Western European nation has displayed a cultural consumption pattern unlike that of its long similar neighbor is the puzzle to which we now turn.

We proceed as follows: in the next section, we explore the culturally meaningful traits of the Portuguese and Spanish roads to democracy. We show that while Spain's macro-political transition emphasized consensus, Portugal's transition generated both cultural transformation and a partial inversion of hierarchies. We will show how the consensus-oriented regime transition in Spain had the decisive consequence of inhibiting as full a transformation of educational institutions as in revolutionary Portugal. *We argue that educational institutions constitute the crucial intermediating mechanism, causally linking macro-level historical change to processes of taste formation at the individual level.* We follow with a focused comparison of the two educational systems that delineates the legacy of macro-political divergence in the 1970s for pedagogical practice and outcomes in the two cases. We rely on a variety of secondary sources including existing scholarly literature, documentary evidence and findings from two large teacher and student surveys carried out throughout Europe. Finally, we provide supplementary evidence taken from our own qualitative fieldwork -- involving in-depth interviews with high school teachers and educational experts -- in both national cases. This in-depth analysis allows us to trace the *within-case causal processes* involved in generating the Iberian difference in cultural activation among post-transition cohorts.

4.   Divergent Political and Cultural Pathways

The problem we address deals with a larger point of debate in the study of regime transformations. Do differing roads to democracy generate contrasts in the end-result —as Stepan (1986) and others have argued? Or is the democratization process subject to the principle of *equifinality* – according to which varying pathways lead to essentially the same

result – as others have suggested (Karl and Schmitter 1991)? Although the existence of major contrasts between the Iberian cases in the form taken by regime change is essentially undisputed, the recent argument that these contrasting democratization scenarios have induced major enduring *social consequences* (Fishman 2010) has not yet elicited such broad consensus. Our analysis addresses the larger debate in a novel way, broadening the playing field by including macro-level differences in cultural dispositions as an outcome worthy of consideration.

In developing our argument, we build on the work of others. Democratization and equivalently large processes of macro-political change can be expected to transform not only formal political institutions but also, to varying degrees, social practices, and dominant cultural understandings (Cook, Hardin and Levi 2005). From this perspective, case-specific features of democratization scenarios should result in concrete modifications of previously existing national linkages between politics and culture (Berezin 2009). The two cases on which we focus differed fundamentally in the nature of the cultural processes that developed in the context of regime change. We therefore expect the two cases to differ also in the broad cultural understandings and informally institutionalized patterns of *practice* left behind after democratization.

The cultural dimension of Spanish democratization involved the forging of *consensus* oriented symbols and discourses (Edles 1998), a project which promoted an interpretation of the country's past emphasizing dangers of polarization and discouraging the revisiting of historical antagonisms, especially those of the country's civil war (Aguilar 2002). In congruent fashion, the principal *political* constraints and strategies of the Spanish transition gave priority to the search for wide socio-political consensus and, consequently, the avoidance of polarizing initiatives in all spheres (Linz and Stepan 1996; Gunther, Montero and Botella 2004). Many who had earlier aspired to wide-ranging social and cultural change during their activism in opposition to the Franco regime internalized the case for moderation and self-restraint in socio-political action (Fishman, 1990b). The assumptions underpinning the Spanish transition discouraged radical and transformative endeavors.

The Portuguese revolution, in contrast, quite self-consciously took an expansively cultural turn, attempting to activate new sensibilities and capacities while also creating new sources of identity and meaning (Stoer 1983; 1986; Maxwell 1995; Vespeira de Almeida 2007). A fundamental and related feature of the April 1974 revolution was the partial *inversion of hierarchies*. This process first became salient in the Armed Forces itself, and then in a variety of other state and social institutions (Fishman 2011). Crucially for our purposes, *educational establishments* and other cultural institutions were among the entities experiencing an inversion of hierarchies. Students and left-oriented teachers carried out purges both at the high school level and in University faculties (Costa Pinto 2001, 2006). This led to rapid changes in both the personnel engaged in educational endeavors and the prevailing cultural climate and institutional paradigm within the educational sector (Stoer 1982; 1983; 1986). Workers occupied urban enterprises (Durán Muñoz 2000) as well as agricultural estates (Bermeo 1986). Gender relations were substantially transformed (Ferreira 1998); the widespread challenge to social hierarchies broadly influenced urban neighborhoods and movements (Hammond, 1988; Ramos Pinto 2008). Such actions generated a variety of "spillover" effects transforming practice itself, as reflected in the enhanced civic participation and efficacy, for example, of agricultural workers who had formed farming cooperatives (Bermeo 1986: 140-143).

Whereas the consensus-oriented cultural energy of the Spanish transition quickly lost strength (Edles 1998: 147), the transformative cultural endeavors forged in the Portuguese revolution have proved to be durable in important ways. This is exemplified by the institutionalization of official commemorative symbols and popular practices of remembrance of the sort that are constitutive of collective memory, as reflected by the retelling and annual commemoration of Portugal's revolutionary story of April 1974. This collective commemoration, with its explicit emphasis on the partial inversion of hierarchies and the poetic opening of new cultural spaces and forms, recreates elements of the original liberation from dictatorship on a yearly basis thoroughly woven into normal life both within and outside official institutions. The annual commemorative session of parliament, the demonstrations and celebrations in the streets and the anniversary activities organized within schools and other institutions keep the story of social revolution alive in

contemporary Portugal.[9] The cultural energies devoted to formal efforts to teach the story of the revolution to children, exemplified in the instructional books written by a group of scholars led by a prominent social theorist, underscore this point (Santos et. al. 2004).

The revolutionary beginnings of Portugal's democracy have shaped democratic practice as well as more strictly institutional legacies evident in numerous settings – from schools to media newsrooms – in which participatory or consultative bodies provide greater voice for hierarchical subordinates than in many other contemporary democratic systems (Fishman 2011). Whereas the cultural project intertwined with Spain's transition was a cautious one emphasizing consensus and reconciliation, the one intermeshed with Portugal's route to democracy was expansive, questioning established authorities, challenging such traditional boundaries as the line between school and external creative activity, and seeking to activate citizen capacities.

The Impact of Transition on Educational Institutions

The divergent pathways to democracy of our two cases have resulted in fundamental differences both in the post-transition institutional design of the school systems and, crucially, in actual educational *practice*.[10] We argue that these differences have had major consequences for the extent to which any given level of educational attainment *activates* the capacity for omnivorous cultural tastes. Crucially, we provide evidence of, and a rationale for, *the divergent effects of formally equivalent education for the development of certain cultural dispositions*. Our structured comparison of the two Iberian cases is especially well situated to uncover the potential for such cross-national difference in the effect of schooling. Revolutions have typically pursued fundamental educational change as one of their central objectives (Ewing 2005), a pattern repeated in the Portuguese case. In contrast, Spain's consensus-oriented road to democracy rendered unlikely a fundamental cultural reframing of the educational system and instead solidified rather hierarchical understandings and practices within schools (Fernández Enguita, 1987; 1993).

The Spanish transition's search for consensus among former historical adversaries led to an "education pact" providing for compromise between republican advocates of

educational innovation and conservative defenders of traditional and Catholic education, much of it carried out in private schools enjoying public financial support (Maravall 1995; Fernandez Mellizo-Soto 2001). The ability of Spanish democrats to pursue fundamental cultural change through transformative public education – as had been attempted in Spain's polarized Second Republic of the 1930s (Boyd 1997; Jorganes 2008) and again, decades later, in Portugal's social revolutionary road to democracy – was curtailed by this agreement. Socialist governments centered their educational reform initiatives on mass *access* to education rather than an effort to remake educational philosophy and pedagogical practice (Fernandez Mellizo-Soto, 2001). As we shall see below, the dynamics constraining Spanish education from pursuing an agenda of expansive cultural change are reflected not only in official policy but also in teacher practice.

In Portugal, students and left-oriented teachers purged numerous high schools and University Faculties of right-wing supporters of the authoritarian old regime following the captains' coup of April 25, 1974, which initiated the democratizing Carnation Revolution. This resulted in a rapid transformation of the internal dynamics of educational institutions. Although many of those purged were subsequently welcomed back to their previous positions, the entry of the revolution's supporters into positions of responsibility, and the shift in predominant forms of practice left an enduring mark. Portuguese educational centers also experienced an abrupt transformation of their decision-making structures and educational philosophies – including those related to cultural capacities. The Portuguese revolution, like other social revolutions, was quite self-conscious and explicit about its aspiration to transform national culture. In the first year after the Revolution of the Carnations the left-oriented Armed Forces Movement (MFA), which took power in April 1974, launched a large-scale if controversial "cultural dynamization" campaign intended to change the thinking and practices of uneducated and rural citizens (Vespeira de Almeida, 2007).

The revolution's cultural climate and agenda encouraged teacher initiatives intended to expand the cultural and civic horizons of students. Meanwhile, its anti-hierarchical tendencies served to reduce organizational constraints on such endeavors. An

informational bulletin of the MFA published in the fall of 1974 presented this new outlook in telling fashion: "We have to win the cultural battle, which is not only what the books teach. The schools [must] go out to the streets and the streets [must] go into the schools, through musical bands, folklore, orchestras, songs, dances, poetry, theater, the circus, the cinema, artisanry, and the plastic arts" (Cited in Stoer 1986: 155). Admittedly, the revolutionary effervescence characterizing the year and half following April 1974 was ultimately reined in by the push for normalization and re-institutionalization. Nevertheless, as the work of Stephen Stoer shows, long after the assembly-like atmosphere had faded, the Portuguese educational system retained the institutional and ideational legacies of its encounter with revolution. This includes a student-centered educational ethos articulated around "a radical pedagogy which tried to encourage the personal freedom and autonomy of students" (Stoer 1982: 17; See also Stoer 1983, 1986).

5.   Educational Practice and the Role of Culture in the School Curriculum

Given what we have argued thus far, we should be able to observe clear cross-case differences in the contemporary make-up, practices and outcomes of educational institutions. In this section, we review the comparative evidence. The two cases differ markedly in the time and resources devoted to cultural education. A 2009 report prepared by the European Commission's educational agency found that—at the primary school level—the time devoted to cultural education in Portugal was more than twice that of Spain (Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency [EACEA] 2009). This contrast was also evident one decade earlier when Pedró and Puig (1999) noted Spain's relatively limited allocation of primary school time to cultural matters.

Additionally, following the 1970s transitions, education spending consistently represented a higher share of GDP in Portugal and the teacher/student ratio at the primary level has been significantly better: a 1992 study found a 1/17 ratio in Portugal as opposed to 1/26 in Spain. (Husen, et. al. 1992: 338). Even more telling is the contrast in how the two systems evaluate student work. In Portugal the assessment of performance in cultural subjects during the first years of primary school avoids quantitative categorization whereas Spain is one of only three European countries in which students can be held back a

grade if they fail cultural knowledge exams (EACEA 2009). A 2007/2008 study of the EACEA noted that the Spanish system conceptualizes student evaluation as an assessment of "the degree of knowledge acquisition" (EACEA 2007/8b:9). In the Portuguese system, with its emphasis on capacity-building and non-hierarchical practice, the evaluation of students includes a "discussion-centered" approach (Blyth and Galton, 1989: 198-211).

The two systems also differ in their understandings of the purpose and composition of culture in the curriculum. Portuguese but not Spanish schools are expected to offer students cultural options, and the Portuguese system – but not the Spanish one – is committed to systematically linking extra-curricular and curricular activities. The Portuguese have provided greater emphasis on school outings as well as visits of outsiders to the school for multiple purposes (Blyth and Galton, 1989); in Spain extra-curricular activities require approval by internal school boards (EACEA, 2007/8b: 18). In the case of musical education, Portugal has prioritized enabling students to sing multiple genres and styles (EACEA, 2007/8a: 7). In devising ways to meet cultural objectives, the Portuguese system has fostered greater connections with the surrounding community (Kallen, 1997: 103, 111). Both the subject matter of cultural education and the social relations among those involved are understood in less hierarchical ways in Portugal than Spain.

This pattern of cross-national difference is reflected in the findings of teacher and student surveys at the high school level. A mid-1990s survey of ninth grade students and teachers of history carried out across Europe showed Portugal and Spain to be located at *opposite ends of the continuum* in the extent to which students agreed with the statement that "We discuss [in class] different explanations about what happened in the past." Portuguese students were the most likely (3.54 out of a possible 5 points) and Spanish students the least likely (2.41 out of the possible 5 points) to agree that their discussions in history classes incorporated alternative explanations (Machado Pais 1999: 43). The same study found that when asked about their pedagogical objectives, Spanish teachers were substantially more likely than their Portuguese counterparts (4.11 vs. 3.63 out of a possible 5 points) to report that they attempt to cover "the principal facts of history" (Machado Pais 1999: 55).

Data from TALIS, a large-scale OECD study of teachers in twenty-three mostly European countries, provide additional evidence of the contrast between our two cases. When asked to identify the criteria used to evaluate their own work, Portuguese teachers were *above* the cross-national average and Spanish teachers *below* that average in mentioning three key categories; first, the consideration of extra-curricular activities with students (72.9% vs. 59.8%); second, the inclusion of student feedback (82.7% vs. 54.9%); and third, the incorporation of parental feedback (73.3% vs. 59.7%). Portuguese teachers were also more likely to be evaluated on the basis of their use of innovative teaching practices (69.4% vs. 59.5%) whereas Spanish teachers were more likely to be judged by the relatively conservative benchmark of student test scores (69.5% vs. 64.4%). (OECD, 2009: 179, 180).[11]

In-depth research by Fernández Enguita (1993) inside Spanish schools shows how teachers' professional self-conception typically involves a hierarchical approach to students, a narrowly technical understanding of pedagogy and skepticism toward extra-curricular initiatives including field trips. In perhaps his most critical assessment of social relations within Spain's educational system, Fernández Enguita suggests that "as in the army, the principle of authority at times presents itself as more important than the content of its exercise" (1993: 87). In earlier work based on field observation in Spanish schools, Fernández Anguita (1987) finds teacher conduct to be not only hierarchical but also "academicist", organizing classroom activities around the transmission of knowledge that teachers acquire at the university. Crucially, Fernández Anguita argues that teacher practice in Spain has retained such an approach even when governmental reforms sought to transform it. For instance, in the wake of an official effort to shift musical education away from the teacher-centered and canonical model, his fieldwork in four Madrid-area schools found that only one of them adopted a student-centered and multi-genre approach (1987: 192-5). Similarly, representational structures designed to open spaces for student involvement in schools failed to generate meaningful participation, and hierarchical conceptions – especially of the teacher-student relationship – remained dominant (Fernández Enguita, 1993). This is corroborated in the work of other scholars who conclude that while institutional reforms in Spain have attempted, in some measure, to

promote innovative and capacity-enhancing pedagogy, actual *practice* has lagged behind official design. (Doz Orrit 1995: 92; O'Malley 1995; Morgenstern de Finkel 1995).

6.   Elaborating Mechanisms through Fieldwork

Having established the existence of substantial differences of institutional design and practice in the educational systems of the two cases, we consider material from a small number of qualitative interviews with educational practitioners in the two countries. This qualitative material complements the macro-comparative analysis presented above by providing finer-grained contextually oriented insight into within-case mechanisms implicated in producing stark asymmetries in educational practice between the two cases, as well as the linkage between these practices and cross-case differences in cultural tastes among youth.

We interviewed fourteen teachers and visited four high schools in the two countries.[12] We also interviewed one educational inspector and several university-level professors of education. We used this fieldwork as an opportunity to both ask our informants about their personal views and activities *and* to collect detailed information about their own perception of the practices and predispositions typical of the respective educational systems. Due to the characteristic mobility of teachers over the course of their careers in our two cases, informants' experiences encompassed numerous schools other than the ones in which they currently teach. Indeed one of our Portuguese interviewees had taught in nine other schools prior to the current one.[13]

Our analytic goal is to use this qualitative material as the basis for what Brady, Collier and Seawright (2010) call "causal process observations." These are "observations about context, process, or mechanism [that] provide an alternative source of insight into the relationship among explanatory variables." In contrast to data-set observations, whose utility is normally judged in terms of quantity ("breadth of coverage"), causal process observations are judged in terms of quality or "depth of insight" since "[e]ven one causal-process observation may be valuable in making [causal] inferences" (Brady et al 2010: 24).

We followed an interview approach closely aligned with the logic that Mario Small (2009) has formulated as "sequential interviewing". From our first interview – outside Lisbon in the Queluz Liceu – we treated each teacher's experience as a *case* capable of highlighting at least one mechanism promoting or discouraging omnivorous taste among students. Our line of questioning developed progressively in order to either replicate earlier findings of such a mechanism or instead to elucidate an alternative mechanism. With a small number of interviews, we were able to provide substance to our understanding of the causal processes at work. We make no distributional claim based on our qualitative fieldwork. Instead, we use it to strengthen our argument about *how* practices found in the two school systems *can* generate the patterns of cultural choice manifested in our quantitative data. These in-depth interviews help us build a situated and nuanced understanding of currents present in the *implicit culture* (Wuthnow and Witten 1988: 51) and the forms of institutionalized *practices* (Swidler 2001: 191-194; Sewell 2005: 164) of high school teachers in the two cases.

Cultural activation via the pedagogical cultivation of critical attitudes

Our first interview, with a physical education instructor, highlighted how some Portuguese teachers self-consciously seek to activate the capacities necessary for questioning dominant perspectives. Luis proudly noted how he likes to inform students of their rights and of ways to demonstrate to defend those rights, adding "when there are student demonstrations in Lisbon I tell them when and how to demonstrate."[14] He also noted with pride the existence, in the high school where he teaches, of an extra-curricular student theater group led by a fellow teacher and the participatory role of students in decision-making. The same mechanism was manifested in the effort of teachers to expand cultural sensibilities and tastes of students. Elsa Castro, a teacher of Portuguese and French language and literature noted her endeavors to activate students' critical abilities and sense of the world, adding, "I encourage them to learn about new kinds of music. Sometimes I choose Chopin, Verdi, classical music. I put on classical music when they are reading and working. One student told me a week later, 'I saw my father has classical music at home and now I am starting to listen to it'." Castro added, "This is the little seed we put in the ground.[15]

If exposure in educational settings to musical styles such as classical music differs systematically between the two cases, we should expect strong cross-national differences in classical music preference among youth. The 2001 Eurobarometer data provide suggestive evidence. Whereas only 8% of Spanish youth born after 1977 report listening to classical music, the corresponding figure in Portugal doubles to 16% ($p < 0.01$). The cross-case contrast becomes starker if we consider only respondents who were less than 20 years old and who were still enrolled in school at the time of the Eurobarometer interview. Only 3% of Spaniards in this category report listening to classical music in comparison to 12% of Portuguese ($p < 0.01$), (a four to one ratio). The cross-national difference in classical music preference does not exist among persons born before 1977. In fact, Spaniards born during or before transition are slightly more likely than their Portuguese counterparts to listen to classical music (25% versus 20%; $p < 0.05$), ruling out an essentialist interpretation of this finding.[16]

Cultural activation via student-centered rather than curriculum centered practices

Several of our informants noted their efforts to build student capacities extending beyond the curricular material and disciplinary knowledge transmitted in the classroom. Sara, a teacher of philosophy emphasized her commitment to expand student capacities: "We try to open their minds so that they think by themselves, not like their parents."[17] She added, "The teacher is someone who tries to develop the abilities of students and doesn't just transmit information". Isabel, a history teacher, noted that "every time there is a possibility I take students to museums, monuments etc. I take students to see works of Kandinsky, Picasso and so on."[18] Both of these teachers articulated an inclusive multi-vocal conception of culture and noted their commitment to nurturing creativity, and the expansion of cultural horizons. [19]

The remarks of this informant elucidate a systematic difference between the two cases. Only about 4% of Spaniards who were less than 20 years old, and still enrolled in school at the time of the 2001 Eurobarometer, report being frequent visitors (at home or abroad) to a museum (coded as having attended four or more times in the past year). The corresponding figure in Portugal is about three and half times as large (14%), a substantial

cross-national contrast in cultural participation among youth.[20] It is likely that museum visitors in the Iberian Peninsula fit the profile of museum visitors in other settings, who tend to be relatively tolerant in terms of broader values and "multicultural" in their orientation toward aesthetic appreciation (see for instance DiMaggio [1996] for the case of the United States). This cross-national disparity in engagement in the arts among younger cohorts is both indicative of the effectiveness of the cultural activation strategies institutionalized in the Portuguese educational system and of the concomitant creation of qualitatively distinct taste-cultures among youth in the two cases.

Cultural activation via the absence of institutional restraints on teacher creativity

Given our interest in how the relative degree of hierarchy in social relations within schools may affect the viability of capacity-enhancing education, we asked all of our respondents whether they had experienced – or were aware of – restraints on creative teacher initiatives in cultural activation. All of our Portuguese informants (with one exception, noted below) indicated that their creative curriculum-expanding endeavors met with institutional support. Crucially, they also noted that it would be unheard of for school authorities to interfere with teacher initiatives intended to activate student cultural capacities in a creative way. They were emphatic in insisting on the absence of any top-down interference with teacher initiative in such matters as external trips to political or cultural events, invitations to external actors to visit school, as well as musical, theatrical, artistic and civically oriented activities within the school. We understand such teacher confidence in their ability to engage in *unrestrained innovation* as a mechanism supportive of robust educational efforts at cultural activation.

The one exception to this pattern consisted of a "special projects" (*area do projeto*) instructor in the country's high-school level military academy where the school's institutional structure was far more hierarchical than in the entire rest of the Portuguese system. That instructor reported being expected to seek approval from the academy's (military) director for special curriculum-expanding activities.[21] The contrast between this teacher's experience and that of all the other interviewed teachers in Portugal reflects the

importance of the lack of perceived hierarchical interference in teacher creativity as a mechanism supportive of taste-expansion in high schools.

Roadblocks to cultural activation via hierarchical restraints on teacher creativity

Our interviews with Spanish teachers identified three mechanisms – hierarchical restraints on teacher and student creativity, widespread pressure to cover pre-designed curricular plans fully, and a pervasive canonical understanding of culture – that play a key role in limiting the potential for the development of omnivorous dispositions among Spanish youth. In our interviews, we probed to see whether mechanisms at work in Portuguese high schools were also operative in the Spanish context. What we learned was that some of those Spanish teachers who *are* personally predisposed toward cultural activation and the broad development of student capacities, report encountering institutional and organizational constraints and resistance. The institutional climate left in place within Spanish schools by the consensual transition proves to be substantially less supportive of the pursuit of cultural activation strategies by teachers than the institutional parameters and forms of practice left in place by Portugal's revolutionary road to democracy.

Maria (a pseudonym), the Director of the most prestigious public high-school in the center of a mid-sized provincial capital south of Madrid, noted how hierarchical teacher attitudes toward students along with professional rigidities imposed by school directors and others (including teachers opposed to innovative practices) can interfere with the development of student cultural capacities.[22] She related the experience of a student who printed out artistic reproductions from a web-based source and upon presenting them proudly to her teacher was reproached for taking an initiative, which that educator felt inappropriate for a student. "The student came to my office in tears", related Maria, and, she continued, there are other similar cases. She added that creative teacher initiatives, such as inviting musicians into the school to perform for students, are sometimes met by criticism from educators concerned about time lost from the pre-established curricular plan. She also noted that field trips out of the school require (an all too often absent) flexibility from school directors in the setting of schedules and so forth. Maria added that

creative teachers often find that school authorities or their colleagues "raise so many difficulties, they announce all of the possible catastrophes" in order to limit innovative activities – such as school visits by musical bands and other cultural actors or external field trips to museums, concerts and so on – that transcend officially designated lesson plans.

Elvira, an innovative teacher in Madrid, related roughly similar experiences. She developed a taste for culturally innovative activities with students in her first teaching assignment. However, after changing to another high school in the Madrid metropolitan area she encountered a lack of support from colleagues, making it impossible for her to continue extra-curricular efforts to develop student artistic sensibilities.[23] Another teacher in the greater Madrid area, noted instances of institutional reticence from school authorities to support innovative field trips she had proposed.[24] This teacher particularly regretted the lack of support preventing her from carrying out a projected field trip to a theatrical performance. She lamented that the curiosity of younger students is not cultivated by the school and that the older students appear less curious.

Roadblocks to cultural activation via curriculum-centered pedagogical practices

Spanish high school teachers are certified based on their mastery of disciplinary knowledge rather than pedagogical technique. Many are influenced by a sense of duty to cover all of the officially designated material for the courses they teach. Our interviews made it clear that such proclivities constitute a mechanism helping to explain *why* Spanish high schools fail to expand student musical tastes as fully as in Portugal. Raúl, a young and thoughtful teacher of literature in Madrid reported a strong emphasis in the school where he teaches on meeting the expectations of centrally designed syllabi, and his own commitment to covering all of the material.[25] Tere, a recently retired high school philosophy teacher in Barcelona, echoed that perception, noting that most of her colleagues were concerned primarily to fully meet the curricular guidelines of established course syllabi.[26] A Madrid teacher, Minuca, noted pressures from both school authorities and parents for basic instruction, rather than a capacity-enhancing emphasis on the development of creative and critical abilities.[27] Feliciano, a broadly knowledgeable Madrid teacher of history, observed that high school teacher practice manifests a weaker interest

in efforts to develop student capacities and a greater attachment to officially drawn-up curricular objectives than is suggested by the official philosophy of Ministry of Education policies.[28] Culturally and historically rooted forms of practice, as well as formal institutional design, underpin the cross-national difference. Even an educational inspector, the head of the state's inspection service in a mid-sized Spanish province south of Madrid, lamented the overwhelming attachment of Spanish teachers to centrally established curricular guidelines[29].

Roadblocks to cultural activation via an emphasis on canonical understandings of culture

Our Spanish informants were unanimous in indicating that a canonical approach to cultural education, emphasizing widely recognized great works and assuming the existence of meaningful consensus on what the principal historical or cultural references *are*, predominates among their colleagues. In contrast, among their Portuguese counterparts, many educators conceptualize culture and its benefits in an *inclusive* manner, incorporating many (extra-canonical) expressive voices. Contemporary research in the sociology of taste suggests that the "canonical" approach to cultural works stands opposed to the "anti-canonical" (or post-canonical) attitude of the cultural omnivore (Peterson and Kern 1996; DiMaggio 1996; Ollivier 2008). Thus, the dominant canon-centric form of educational practice in the Spanish case stands as an important mechanism accounting for the failure of Spanish youth to develop the omnivorous disposition to the same extent as their Portuguese peers.

Summary

Our analysis of secondary evidence and qualitative material on post-transition educational policy and practice in Spain and Portugal sheds light on processes responsible for the observed differences in the manifestation of the omnivorous disposition between Portuguese and Spanish youth. We have shown the Portuguese system to be characterized by a *student-centered*, *capacity-building* approach to education as well as an expansive sense of the cultural products – and capacities – meriting attention in school, with evident consequences for Portuguese youth. Teachers in Portugal contribute to activation in a

variety of ways encompassing civic engagement, cultural consumption and production. In their efforts at cultural activation, the Portuguese teachers we interviewed were motivated by an *inclusive multi-vocal* sense of culture – "dialogic" in Bakhtin's (1981) sense – incorporating diverse voices, styles and perspectives within the material and experiences to which students are exposed. This emphasis on both civic and more narrowly cultural forms of activation is important, as omnivorous patterns of cultural taste have been shown to be systematically related to a distinctly "open" and "multicultural" orientation toward both the political and civic realms (Bryson 1996; van Eijck and Lievens 2008; Ollivier 2008; Lizardo 2005).

The Spanish system, in contrast, has been marked by a *content-centered* and relatively *hierarchical* approach to education emphasizing a *canon-based conception* of the cultural products deserving inclusion in instruction. Portuguese schools treat cultural education, including music, as an important matter in the transformation and growth of students, a strategy that incorporates a broad range of experiences into schooling and helps to facilitate the omnivorous disposition. Spanish schools provide less emphasis on cultural education, treating it instead as one element of the codified material to be transmitted to students and on which to test their knowledge. The revolutionary impulse to use education as a force promoting cultural and civic activation, and as a setting for nonhierarchical participatory engagement, remains evident in Portugal. There, teacher innovations, and efforts to cultivate in students an understanding of difference, are encouraged. The Spanish system, in contrast, is more highly focused on teachers' sense of professional responsibility to impart concrete programs of canonical knowledge. The evidence reveals that these differences – constituted by a broad array of factors and rooted in the two countries' dissimilar pathways to democracy – are amply manifested in both the official design of education and actual practice.

7.   Conclusion

Our study offers a new perspective on the making of cultural tastes and the interconnection of political and cultural processes – emphasizing their joint embeddedness in macro-historical transformations that vary by country. Our theorization is built on a

multi-method analysis of the post-democratization divergence between Portugal and Spain in patterns of cultural consumption. We make use of the strategic paired comparison provided by these two cases to specify mechanisms and processes that underpin the social production of omnivorous tastes and to establish the capacity of macro-historical turning points to reshape such processes in consequential ways. We have argued that the two countries' dissimilar pathways to democracy generated a sharp difference in institutional practices within the school system and that this post-democratization divergence led to fundamentally different patterns of cultural consumption in the youth of the two countries.

Contributions to the sociology of taste and culture consumption

Opening up the education black box. - This paper contributes to recent work on the emergence of the "patterned tolerance" represented by omnivorous taste as well as scholarship on the intersection of politics, institutions and lifestyle practices (Bourdieu 1984; van Eijck and Lievens 2008; Bryson 1996; Ollivier 2008; Johnston and Baumann 2007). The correlation between markers of status (such as educational attainment) and omnivorous taste is a well-established finding (Peterson and Rossman 2008; Bennett et al 2009. The most plausible explanation for this effect is that the school is the primary institution (outside of the family) where persons acquire and hone dispositions towards the consumption of cultural goods (Bourdieu 1993; DiMaggio 1991; Lizardo 2008). No study that we know of has actually examined whether this is the operative mechanism because they rely on correlational evidence of the education/omnivorousness link. Such evidence, although adequate for "establishing the phenomenon," is not useful for elucidating the mechanisms that generate it (Hedstrom and Swedberg 1998). Our research helps to deepen the understanding of processes through which education expands cultural tastes or fails to do so, thus opening up this particular "black box." We show that the empirical generalization that education promotes omnivorousness rests on specific institutional practices. These practices are, in turn, contingent on the historical development of the political and educational arenas of national cases (Bourdieu 1991; DiMaggio 1991).

Rethinking our understanding of the connection between social change and cultural taste. - A key theoretical implication of our analysis is that contextually-rooted institutional dynamics produce systematic differences in the *strength* of the linkage between education and omnivorous taste. We expect such variation both *between* national cases and *within* cases across historical periods. We conclude that case-specific processes that result in more student-centered and less canon-oriented forms of educational practice should be more effective in activating the cultural aptitudes of students, resulting in the production of omnivorous taste publics. Individuals with "lower" levels of formal education in one context may manifest levels of cultural activation characteristic of persons with "higher" education in another. This appears to be the case with Nordic welfare states such as Denmark and Finland, where omnivorousness is more equitably distributed across education levels than in other European cases (Virtanen 2007). In the very same way, changes in educational practice, either progressive (from less to more student-centered) or vice-versa should create systematic differences in the cultural openness of students, differences that should leave cohort-specific traces. Rather than focusing on biological age we emphasize the impact of educational systems – themselves subject to historical change – on specific *generations*.

Contributions to the Study of Macro-Historical Processes of Social and Cultural Change

This study contributes to our understanding of the cultural consequences of democratic transition processes. We show how the enduring impact of divergent democratization scenarios manifests itself in social arenas—such as educational systems and national patterns of cultural consumption—that on the surface may seem far removed from the institutional core of political regime transition. We build on work arguing that democratic transitions may transform not only political institutions but also, to one degree or another, social practices and understandings across a wide range of spheres (Cook, Hardin and Levi 2005; Chapter 9). Our findings suggest that researchers interested in the enduring consequences of democratization scenarios should take cognizance of educational practice and cultural consumption outcomes. We thus offer novel grounds of

support for Stepan's (1986) classic argument that historical pathways to democracy hold independent causal significance.

Our empirical work shows that differences between the two national settings in the historically grounded social relations, predominant ideas and institutional structure found within schools, and among teachers, help to explain the fundamentally divergent impact of secondary education on cultural sensibilities among Spanish and Portuguese youth. We view these contrasts in educational practice as one of the primary micro-level mechanisms generating the observed cross- case contrast in cultural choice among those born post-transition. Yet, the educational contrast rests, in turn, on the macro-historical mechanism: the impact of democratizing pathways on the design and practice of schooling. Other differences may serve as complementary causal mechanisms, contributing to the magnitude of the cross-case difference, but the contrasts that we identify in the contexts within which teachers carry out their work are robust ones, generative of a consequential divergence in educational practice.

Our analysis of the macro-historical underpinnings of national patterns of taste formation is consistent with a body of work showing that transnational processes—such as economic globalization or the construction of the European Union—are filtered through historically embedded lenses (Guillen 2001; Diez Medrano 2003). Similarly, nation-specific causal configurations grounded in history help to determine the kinds of practices that predominate within institutions—such as the educational system. The structured comparison of Portugal and Spain provides a lens that helps us to appreciate three things. The first is how nationally concrete histories and politics powerfully shape routine institutional practices. The second is how these practices may work to activate cultural sensibilities differentially across cases. The third is how the affinity between political and cultural openness may best be conceptualized as resting on their shared linkage to historical processes and carriers of change, and not simply on their affinity qua broad "cultural logics" (Swidler 2001: 187). These three claims share two important features. One is their common emphasis on the causal force of large-scale historical processes. The other is their stress on complex interactions between the arenas of culture, politics and social

hierarchy (Hall and Lamont 2009). In the end, our study demonstrates the utility of an approach to social scientific analysis that emphasizes these factors, one that is rooted in a Weberian sensibility that is simultaneously configurational, historical and mechanism based. We show that historically contingent processes of change shape how institutions affect individuals and thus how such effects, themselves, may be subject to change – especially in the wake of major historical turning points.

References

Abbott, Andrew. 2001. *Time Matters: On Theory and Method*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Aguilar, Paloma. 2002. *Memory and Amnesia: The Role of the Spanish Civil War in the Transition to Democracy*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Bakhtin, Mikhail M. 1981. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.

Bennett, Tony, Mike Savage and Elizabeth Silva, Alan Warde, Modesto Gayo-Cal and David Wright. 2009. *Culture, Class, Distinction*. New York: Routledge.

Berezin, Mabel. 1997. "Culture and Politics: A Less Fissured Terrain". *Annual Review of Sociology.* 23: 361-383.

_____. 2009. *Illiberal Politics in Neoliberal Times: Culture, Security and Populism in the New Europe.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bermeo, Nancy. 1986. *The Revolution within the Revolution: Workers' Control in Rural Portugal*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

_____. 1987. "Redemocratization and Transition Elections: A Comparison of Spain and Portugal", *Comparative Politics*, 19(2): 213-230.

Blyth, W. A. L. and Maurice Galton. 1989. *Handbook of Primary Education in Europe*. London: Fulton.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1984. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1990. *The Logic of Practice*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1991. "First Lecture. Social Space and Symbolic Space: Introduction to a Japanese Reading of Distinction." *Poetics Today* 12:627-638.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1993. *The Field of Cultural Production.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Boyd, Carolyn P. 1997. *Historia Patria: Politics, History and National Identity in Spain, 1875-1975*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Brady, Henry E.; David Collier and Jason Seawright. 2010. "Refocusing the Discussion on Methodolog." Pp. 15-31 in H. E. Brady and D. Collier (Eds.) *Rethinking Social Inquiry*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

Bryson, Bethany. 1996. "Anything But Heavy Metal': Symbolic Exclusion and Musical Dislikes." *American Sociological Review* 61:884-900.

Candeias, António, et. al. 2007. *Alfabetizaçao e Escola em Portugal nos Séculos XIX e XX, 2ª Ediçao*. Lisboa: Fundaçao Calouste Gulbenkian.

Christensen, Thomas. 2003. *Eurobarometer 56.0: information and communication technologies, financial services, and cultural activities, august-September 2001* [computer file]. 2nd ICPSR version. Brussels: European Opinion Research Group EEIG [producer], 2001. Cologne, Germany: Zentralarchiv fur Empirische Sozialforschung/Ann Arbor, MI: Inter-University Consortium For Political And Social Research [distributors].

Cook, Karen S., Russell Hardin and Margaret Levi, 2005. *Cooperation without Trust?* New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

Costa Pinto, Antonio. 2001. "Settling Accounts with the Past in a Troubled Transition to Democracy: The Portuguese Case": 65-91 in Alexandra Barahona de Brito et. al. (eds.) *The Politics of Memory: Transitional Justice in Democratizing Societies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

_____. 2006. "Authoritarian Legacies, Transitional Justice and State Crisis in Portugal's Democratization". *Democratization*. 13(2): 173-204.

De Nora, Tia. 2000. *Music in Everyday Life*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Diez Medrano, Juan. 2003. *Framing Europe: Attitudes to European Integration in Germany, Spain and the United Kingdom.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

DiMaggio, Paul. 1987 "Classification in Art." *American Sociological Review* 52: 440-455.

_____. 1991. "Social Structure Institutions and Cultural Goods: The Case of the United States." Pp. 133-155 in *Social Theory for a Changing Society*, edited by Pierre Bourdieu and James Coleman. Boulder Colorado: Westview Press.

_____. 1996. "Are art-museum visitors different from other people? The relationship between attendance and social and political attitudes in the United States." *Poetics* 24: 161-180.

Doz Orrit, Javier. 1995. "Problems of Implementation in Spanish Educational Reform", 79-93 in Oliver Boyd-Barrett and Pamela O'Malley (eds.). 1995. *Educational Reform in Democratic Spain*. London: Routledge.

Durán Muñoz, Rafael. 2000. *Contencion y Transgresion: Las Movilizaciones Sociales y el Estado en las Transiciones Espanola y Portuguesa*. Madrid: Centro de Estudios Politicos y Constitucionales.

Edles, Laura Desfor. 1998. *Symbol and Ritual in the New Spain: The Transition to Democracy after Franco*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Education, Audiovisual & Culture Executive Agency. 2007/08a. *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe: Portugal.* Brussels: European Commission.

_____. 2007/08b. *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe: Spain.* Brussels: European Commission.

_____. 2009. *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe*. Brussels: European Commission.

Elchardus, M. and Siongers, J. 2007. "Ethnocentrism, taste and symbolic boundaries." *Poetics* 35: 215-238.

Ewing, E. Thomas. (ed.) 2005. *Revolution and Pedagogy*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Fernandes, Tiago. 2007. "Authoritarian Regimes and Pro-Democracy Semi-Oppositions: The End of the Portuguese Dictatorship (1968-1974) in Comparative Perspective", in *Democratization* 14(4): 686-705.

Fernández Enguita, Mariano. 1987. *Reforma educativa, desigualdad social e inserción institucional: La enseñanza secundaria en Espana*. Barcelona: Editorial Laia.

_____. 1993. *La Profesión Docente y la Comunidad Escolar: Crónica de un Desencuentro*. Madrid: Ediciones Morata.

Fernández Mellizo-Soto, María. 2001. *Socialismo, Igualdad en la Educación y Democracia. La Experiencia de González y Mitterand*. Madrid: Instituto Juan March de Estudios e Investigaciones.

Ferreira, Virginia. 1998. "Engendering Portugal: Social Change, State Politics, and Women's Mobilization," : 162 – 188 in Antonio Costa Pinto (ed.) *Modern Portugal*. Palo Alto, CA: The Society for the Promotion of Science and Scholarship.

Fishman, Robert M. 1990a. "Rethinking State and Regime: Southern Europe's Transition to Democracy." *World Politics* 42: 422-440.

_____. 1990b. *Working-Class Organization and the Return to Democracy in Spain*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

_____. 2004. *Democracy's Voices: Social Ties and the Quality of Public Life in Spain*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

_____. 2010. "Rethinking the Iberian Transformations: How Democratization Scenarios Shaped Labor Market Outcomes." *Studies in Comparative International Development* 45: 281-310.

_____. 2011. "Democratic Practice after the Revolution: The Case of Portugal and Beyond", in *Politics & Society*. 39: 233-267.

Graaf, Nan Dirk de. 1991. "Distinction by Consumption in Czechoslovakia, Hungary, and the Netherlands." *European Sociological Review* 7:267-290.

Griffin, Larry J., Christopher Botsko, Ana-Maria Wahl, and Larry W. Isaac. 1991. "Theoretical Generality, Case Particularity: Qualitative Comparative Analysis of Trade Union Growth and Decline." *International Journal of Comparative Sociology* 32: 110-136.

Griswold, Wendy, and Nathan Wright. 2004. "Cowbirds, Locals, and the Dynamic Endurance of Regionalism." *American Journal of Sociology* 109:1411–51.

Guillen, Mauro F. 2001. *The Limits of Convergence: Globalization and Organizational Change in Argentina, South Korea, and Spain*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Gunther, Richard, José Ramón Montero and Joan Botella, 2004. *Democracy in Modern Spain*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Hall, Peter and Michèle Lamont. (eds.) 2009. *Successful Societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hammond, John L. 1988. *Workers' and Neighborhood Movements in the Portuguese Revolution*. New York: Monthly Review Press.

Hedstrom, Peter and Richard Swedberg (eds.). 1998. *Social Mechanisms: An Analytical Approach to Social Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Husen, Torsen, Albert Tuijnman and H.D. Walls (eds.). 1992. *Schooling in Modern European Society.* Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Isaac, Larry W. 1997. "Transforming Localities: Reflections on Time, Causality, and Narrative in Contemporary Historical Sociology." *Historical Methods* 30: 4-12.

Johnston, J. and Baumann, S. 2007. "Democracy versus Distinction: A Study of Omnivorousness in Gourmet Food Writing." *American Journal of Sociology* 113: 165-204.

Jorganes, Juan. (ed.) 2008. *La Escuela de la II Republica*. Sevilla: Cajasol, Fundación Obra Social.

Kallen, Denis. 1997. *Secondary Education in Europe: Problems and Prospects*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe.

Karl, Terry Lyn and Philippe Schmitter. 1991. "Modes of Transition in Latin America, Southern Europe and Eastern Europe". *International Social Science Journal* 43(2):269-284.

Katz-Gerro, Tally. 2002. "Highbrow Cultural Consumption and Class Distinction in Italy, Israel, West Germany, Sweden, and the United States." *Social Forces* 81:207-229.

Katz-Gerro, Tally. 2004. "Cultural Consumption Research: Review of Methodology, Theory, and Consequence." *International Review of Sociology* 4:11-29

Katz-Gerro, T. 2006. "Comparative Evidence Of Inequality In Cultural Preferences Gender, Class, And Family Status." *Sociological Spectrum* 26:63-83.

Kraaykamp, Gerbert and Paul Nieuwbeerta. 2000. "Parental Background and Lifestyle Differentiation in Eastern Europe: Social, Political, and Cultural Intergenerational Transmission in Five Former Socialist Societies." *Social Science Research* 29: 92-122.

Lambert, Paul, Manfred Max Bergman and Ken Prandy. 2005. "Leisurely Moments or Lifetimes? Contexts and the Study of Leisure, Consumption, and Stratification." Presented at the British Household Panel Survey-2005 Research Conference, Colchester, UK.

Lena, Jennifer and Richard A. Peterson. 2009. "Classification as culture: Types and trajectories of music genres." *American Sociological Review* 73: 697-718.

Linz, Juan. 1978. "From Great Hopes to Civil War: The Breakdown of Democracy in Spain", in Juan Linz and Alfred Stepan (eds.). *The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Linz, Juan and Alfred Stepan. 1996. *Problems of Democratic Transition and Consolidation: Southern Europe, South America and Post-Communist Europe.* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Lizardo, Omar. 2005. "Can cultural capital theory be reconsidered in the light of world polity institutionalism? Evidence from Spain." *Poetics* 33:81-110.

_____. 2008. "The Question of Culture Consumption and Stratification Revisited." *Sociologica* 2/2008.

Lizardo, Omar and Sara Skiles. Forthcoming. "Reconceptualizing and theorizing 'omnivorousness': Genetic and relational mechanisms." In *Sociological Theory*.

López-Sintas, Jordi, and Tally Katz-Gerro. 2005. "From exclusive to inclusive elitists and further: Twenty years of omnivorousness and cultural diversity in arts participation in the USA." *Poetics* 33:299-319.

Machado Pais, José. 1999. *Consciencia Histórica e Identidade: Os Jovens Portugueses Num Contexto Europeu*. Oeiras: Celta.

Magalhaes, Pedro C. forthcoming. "Explaining the Constitutionalization of Social Rights: Portuguese Hypotheses and a Cross-National Test", in Denis Galligan and Mila Versteeg (eds.) The Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Mahoney, James and Dietrich Rueschemeyer (eds.). 2003. *Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Maravall, José María. 1995. "The Pre-history of Educational Reform in Spain", 41-52 in Oliver Boyd-Barrett and Pamela O'Malley (eds.). 1995. *Educational Reform in Democratic Spain*. London: Routledge.

Maxwell, Kenneth. 1995. *The Making of Portuguese Democracy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Meyer, John W., and Brian Rowan. (1977). "Institutionalized organizations: Formal structure as myth and ceremony." *American Journal of Sociology*, 83, 340–363.

Modelski, George, William R. Thompson. 1996. *Leading sectors and world powers*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.

Morgenstern de Fenkel, Sara. 1995. "The Teachers' Centres", 178-187 in Oliver Boyd-Barrett and Pamela O'Malley (eds.). 1995. *Educational Reform in Democratic Spain*. London: Routledge.

OECD. 2009. *Creating Effective Teaching and Learning Environments: First Results from TALIS*. Paris: OECD.

Ollivier, Michèle. 2008. "Modes of openness to cultural diversity: Humanist, populist, practical, and indifferent." *Poetics* 36:120-147.

O´Malley, Pamela. 1995. "Education as Resistance: the 'Alternativa'", 32-40 in Oliver Boyd-Barrett and Pamela O'Malley (eds.). 1995. *Educational Reform in Democratic Spain*. London: Routledge.

Pedro, Francesc and Irene Puig. 1999. *Las reformas educativas: Una perspectiva politica y comparativa.* Barcelona: Paidos.

Peterson, Richard A. 1992. "Understanding Audience Segmentation: From Elite and Popular to Omnivore and Univore." *Poetics* 21:243-258.

_____. 2005 "Problems in Comparative Research: The Example of Omnivorousness." *Poetics* 33: 257-282.

Peterson, Richard A, and Roger M Kern. 1996. "Changing Highbrow Taste: From Snob to Omnivore." *American Sociological Review* 61:900-907.

Peterson, Richard A. and Gabriel Rossman. 2008. "Changing arts audiences: capitalizing on omnivorousness." In: S. Tepper W. Ivey (eds.), *Engaging art: the next great transformation of America's cultural life*. New York: Routledge.

Pierson, Paul. 2004. *Politics in Time: History, Institutions and Social Analysis*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Ragin, Charles C. 2008. *Redesigning Soicla Inquiry*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Ramos Pinto, Pedro. 2008. "Urban Social Movements and the Transition to Democracy in Portugak, 1974-1976." *The Historical Journal* 51(4): 1025-1046.

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa, et. al. 2004. *25 de Abril: Uma Aventura para a Democracia*. Porto: Afrontamento & Coimbra: Centro de Documentaçao 25 de Abril.

Schwartzman, Kathleen C. 1989. *The Social Origins of Democratic Collapse: The First Portuguese Republic in the Global Economy*. Lawrence, KA: University of Kansas Press.

Sewell, William H. 2005 *Logics of History*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Skocpol, Theda. 1979. *States and Social Revolution*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Small, Mario Luis. 2009. " 'How Many Cases Do I Need?' On science and the logic of case selection in field-based research." *Ethnography* 10(1): 5-38.

Steinmetz, George. (ed.) 1999. *State/Culture: State Formation after the Cultural Turn*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Stepan, Alfred. 1986. "Paths Toward Redemocratization: Theoretical and Comparative Considerations" 64-84 in Guillermo O'Donnell, Philippe Schmitter and Laurence Whitehead (eds.) *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Comparative Perspectives*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Stoer, Stephen. 1982. *Educacao, estado e desenvolvimento em Portugal*. Lisboa: Livros Horizonte.

_____. 1983. *The April Revolution and the Contribution of Education to Changing 'Portuguese Realities'.* Ph.D. Thesis. Open University.

_____. 1986. *Educacao e mudanca social em Portugal: 1970-1980: Uma decada de transicao*. Porto: Edicoes Afrontamento.

Swidler, Ann. 2001. *Talk of Love: How Culture Matters*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Tarrow, Sidney. 2010. "The Strategy of Paired Comparison: Toward a Theory of Practice." *Comparative Political Studies* 43(2): 230-259.

van Eijck, K., and J. Lievens. 2008. "Cultural omnivorousness as a combination of highbrow, pop, and folk elements: The relation between taste patterns and attitudes concerning social integration." *Poetics* 36: 217-242.

Vespeira de Almeida, Sónia. 2007. "Campanhas de Dinamizaçao Cultural e Acçao Civica do MFA: uma etnografia retrospective" in *Arquivos da Memoria*, N2 (Nova Série).

Vieira, María Manuel. 2007. "Recém-chegados à universidade: entre constrangimentos sociais e projectos individuais", 137-162 in María Manuel Vieira (ed.) *Escola, Jovens e Media*. Lisboa: Imprensa de Ciencias Sociais.

Vieira, Monica Brito and Filipe Carreira da Silva. 2010. *O Momento Constituente: Os Direitos Sociais na Constituiçao*. Coimbra: Almedina.

Villaverde Cabral, Manuel, Jorge Vala and Andre Freire. 2003. *Desigualdades Sociais e Percepçoes de Justiça*. Lisboa: Impresa de Ciencias Sociais.

Virtanen, Taru. 2007. "Across and Beyond the Bounds of Taste: On Cultural Consumption Patterns in the European Union." Working Paper: Turun School of Economics.

Warde, A. and Gayo-Cal, M. 2009. "The anatomy of cultural omnivorousness: the case of the United Kingdom." *Poetics* 37: 119-145.

Wuthnow, Robert and Marsha Witten. 1988. "New Directions in the Study of Culture." *Annual Review of Sociology* 14: 49-67.

[1] We acknowledge that much work on the intersection on culture and politics does explore case-specific historical trajectories (Berezin 1997; Steinmetz 1999). Our main innovation in this paper is to bring that approach to the study of the institutional and socio-cultural factors that influence cultural taste, joining disparate areas of sociological research.

[2] See for instance Bermeo (1987) on political development and Fishman (2010) on the "Iberian employment paradox".

[3] Admittedly, these points of similarity were accompanied by some meaningful differences between the two authoritarian regimes (Fernandes, 2007) and the processes which led to them; yet on balance – and when compared to other national cases – the Iberian Peninsula neighbors appear remarkably similar.

[4] On the connection between relational configurations and cosmopolitan or globalizing discourse see Fishman (2004).

[5] The scale reliability coefficient (Cronbach's α) for the pooled sample is 0.63 (Spain = 0.58; Portugal = 0.70).

[6] For survey data on the predisposition of a large majority of Portuguese public opinion toward policies claiming to redress inequalities, see Villaverde Cabral, Vala and Freire (2003).

[7] See online appendix.

[8] For instance, if we compare those with a high-school education in Portugal with the same group of respondents in Denmark, Sweden and Finland (the top-three most omnivorous nations--by our measure-- among the EU 15 (Virtanen 2007: 150)), we find that Portuguese youth born under the democracy are essentially indistinguishable from their Finnish and Danish counterparts, and are actually *more* omnivorous than their Swedish peers (analysis available on request).

[9] We have carried out extensive fieldwork in Portugal including ethnographic work at the time of the 2004 and 2006 commemorations.

[10] This qualification is important, since it is a key finding in institutional analyses of educational systems that institutional blueprints may be thoroughly "decoupled" from practice (Meyer and Rowan 1977).

[11] Data obtained from TALIS, a large-scale OECD survey of teachers in twenty-three mostly European countries.

[12] In order to insure a high level of trust and comfort on the part of our teacher-informants we identified and reached teachers through university-based academics with contacts among high-school level teachers, This approach, which we followed in both countries yielded a pool of committed and intellectually lively teacher-informants with exposure to classroom instruction in a wide variety of schools and willing to share with us that range of experiences.

[13] Interview with Elsa Castro, Queluz, June 23, 2008.

[14] Interview with Luis Costa, Queluz, February 1, 2008.

[15] Interview with Elsa Castro, Queluz, June 23, 2008.

[16] Similar differences exist for such "newly consecrated" artistic genres as listening to Jazz and Blues. While only 7% of Spanish youth under twenty who were enrolled in school during the survey report listening to this type of music, the corresponding figure in Portugal is 15% ($p < 0.01$). Even Opera, one of the least popular genres in the survey, is relatively more common in the musical life of Portuguese youth born under democracy (4%) than in the life of Spanish youth (1%).

[17] Interview with Sara Fernandes, Febrauary 6, 2008, Lisbon.

[18] Interview with Isabel Matos, February 6, 2008, Lisbon.

[19] Observation during our visits to schools contributed to our full appreciation of the mechanisms at work. The Portuguese commitment to cultural activation is evident in multiple ways including not only classroom – or extra-curricular – activities but also the very physical form taken by high schools. This is important given the emphasis that certain practice theories put on "diffuse" forms of non-conscious cultural transmission mediated by the material environment in the creation of practical dispositions (Bourdieu 1990). In Portugal, external and internal walls of numerous high schools are decorated by student-made copies of well-known nineteenth and twentieth century artistic works. We encountered such paintings in our first high school visit in Portugal in the Queluz Liceu outside Lisbon, and all the interviewed Portuguese teachers indicated that this

use of paintings within high schools is quite common – with the notable one-of-a-kind exception of the military high school in Lisbon where future army officers are trained.

[20] In terms of visiting monuments, there is a less pronounced but still discernible Portuguese advantage: 45% of Spanish youth who were less than 20 years old in 2001 and who were still enrolled in school report visiting a monument at least once in the past year; the corresponding figure in Portugal is 55%.
[21] Interview, Military Academy, June 30 2008.
[22] Interview with the Director of High School #1, in a provincial capital south of Madrid, February 29, 2008.
[23] Interview with Elvira, May 30, 2008.
[24] Interview with Margarita Gonzalez (a pseudonym), May 29, 2008, Madrid.
[25] Interview with Raúl Cazorla, May 28, 2008, Madrid.
[26] Interview with Tere Iribarne, July 18, 2008, Barcelona.
[27] Interview with Minuca, May 29, 2008, Madrid.
[28] Interview with Feliciano Paez Camino, May 28, 2008, Madrid.
[29] Interview with chief educational inspector, Spanish mid-sized provincial capital , February 29, 2008.