INTRODUCTION

Scholarship on the Late Sequence since *Gothic Song*

The music theorist known as Grocheo, writing c. 1300, stated that the sequence was sung in the manner of the *ductia*, and that it would be “light and rapid in its ascents and descents.” As he is the first writer known to us to provide a detailed treatment of both sacred and secular genres of music in a single treatise, it may be telling that he thinks of sequences as among those ecclesiastical chants performed as if they were for dancing.¹ He was writing in Paris, where the so-called late sequence was championed at the Abbey of St. Victor and at the Cathedral of Notre Dame. Grocheo would have heard the styles of singing that developed in the course of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries in what was then the musical capital of Europe. Some sequences Grocheo heard may have been charming, lively works to inspire him to describe them as he does, but they were doubtless sung in a variety of ways, especially in Paris. Students making parodies of them in a Parisian tavern would have sounded differently from Augustinians at St. Victor, who, in turn, would have sung many of the texts to different melodies from those in use at the Cathedral of Notre Dame.² The geographical range of such pieces by the year 1300 extended throughout Europe, from Ireland to Hungary and from Iceland to Southern Italy, and the numbers of works in place and still being created, by new religious orders as well as by Crusaders in the Near East, was enormous.³ *Gothic Song: Victorine Sequences and Augustinian Reform in Twelfth-Century Paris* (Cambridge, 1993), reprinted here, is the first book-length study of the Parisian sequence repertory, the pieces that Grocheo mentioned in his catalogue.⁴

The sequence formed a matrix of melody in the central and later Middle Ages, and was the place in the Mass liturgy where (although there was an established sequence repertory in every region) there was always room for change and for adding new pieces.⁵ As a result, for centuries this was a place where those who were creating new works for the Mass were likely to (1) test their ideas both about composition and the relationships between music and poetry; (2) advance and establish ideas about local saints and new feasts; (3) try out liturgical performance in newly constructed churches; and (4) comment upon the meanings of the Gospel text or of the Eucharistic sacrifice itself. In addition, like the Sanctus of the ordinary and its tropes, the sequence was a genre well suited to metaphorical explorations of song on earth as a sonic shadow of heaven, and, as such, sequences drew the heavenly host with them whenever they were sung.

In *Gothic Song*, I suggest some ways in which sequences could help scholars understand change and continuity in Western medieval culture, and that idea has
continued to be explored by many scholars in recent decades. For example, Gunilla Iversen and Marie-Noel Colette were instrumental in founding an international colloquium focused on poetry and music, which often included sequences, called “Sapientia et Eloquentia: Studies on the Function of Poetry in the Period of Transition from a Monastic to a Scholastic Culture in Medieval Europe.” The trend is reflected in the writings of Lori Kruckenberg, which began to appear in the late 1990s (many of which will be discussed in this overview). Her work has challenged earlier ideas about the sequence as a genre that evolved in three stages—early, transitional, and late—and has been fundamental in expanding the conversation on sequences.6

Gothic Song serves several specific purposes besides the general one of demonstrating the centrality of sequences to western medieval Christian liturgical and artistic experience, and to reading change and continuity. It describes the figure of Adam of St. Victor, who had long been misidentified in the literature, examines the possible layers within the repertories created at various churches in Paris, probes ways the so-called Victorine sequences worked musically and exegetically, and situates them within the intellectual and spiritual ideals of the Augustinian canons regular, especially those of the Abbey of St. Victor. The book has laid a foundation for further work in the field by beginning to straighten out problems that had made the study of late sequences problematic, most importantly, showing how sophisticated the art of contrafacta could be and how profoundly sequences could reflect local and regional political and religious views.7

When I was working on the Victorine sequences in the 1980s and early 1990s, I was struck by the way in which proper tropes fell increasingly out of favor with those institutions, especially houses of Augustinians, who were interested in large repertories of late sequences. Since that time, there has continued to be much work on later proper tropes, especially those in German-speaking lands, and the idea that they “died out” has had to be modified.8 This brief introduction to the second edition reviews scholarship on late sequences since the appearance of Gothic Song in 1993, providing the bibliography necessary for situating the Victorine sequences and the late sequence in general in contemporary thought. The quantity and quality of the work since 1993 suggest that Gothic Song helped to spark a fire of interest in sequences in general, and late sequences in particular. The book continues to challenge historians of all stripes to look to the musical repertories of the figures and communities they study and to learn to read history and the other arts more deeply through understanding ritual song.

In spite of the rich vein of scholarship on the late sequence, surveyed below, more work also needs to be done on performance. The late sequence as a genre became increasingly popular throughout Europe in the course of the twelfth century, and works continued to be written for centuries after late-epoch versification essentially triumphed (although Notkerian and other styles of sequences continued to be sung, copied, and composed as well). What gave this verse and the melodies that accompanied it their appeal? Why was rhyming so important to this liturgical song and its musical sound?9 How, indeed, might these works have sounded, and what were the possibilities?10 The Victorine sequences were groups of texts deliberately linked by melodies and families of melodies. What was the effect of such a text-music sym-
phonia when interrelated pieces were sung? Performers have yet to re-create the kinds of experiments suggested by the sequences and their multiple neumatizations. The exquisite recording “Nova Cantica: Latin Songs of the High Middle Ages” by Dominique Vellard and Emmanuel Bonnardot (Deutsche Harmonia Mundi, 1992), for example, contains one Victorine sequence, “Rex Salomon Fecit Templum.” This is a piece that the Victorines sang as part of a group of six, with all texts set to a wonderful melody based upon the hymn tune “Ave Maris Stella.” What would it mean to hear the hymn, and at least one other of the sequences, with the performers allowing for the interplay between the texts sustained by the music? One can only hope that the scholarship reviewed here will inspire more performers to take up the genre.11

Adam of St. Victor and the Development of the Victorine Sequence Repertory

Of all the sequence poets of the Latin Middle Ages, Adam of St. Victor is among the most praised, as any standard discussion of medieval Latin verse will demonstrate. Never was so little known, however, about someone so famous. Richard of St. Victor, while not naming Adam, recognizes him an outstanding poet (“egregius versificator”); the Cistercian Alan of Lille (d. c. 1202) and the Dominican Thomas of Cantimpré (1201–1272) mention him by name.12 Revisionist Victorines in the fourteenth century caused confusion by identifying him with a shadowy late-twelfth-century figure, Adam Brito. But there is, indeed, ample evidence to locate the real Adam of St. Victor, poet and musician, among the men who attempted to implement Victorine religious reforms in the Cathedral of Notre Dame of Paris in the first half of the twelfth century. He was surely one and the same with the precentor of Notre Dame Cathedral, who left for the Abbey of St. Victor in the 1130s, transferring the income from his prebend to the Abbey, and dying c. 1146. The appearance of a significant number of sequences in the liturgies of both the cathedral and the Abbey of St. Victor, and the establishment of two interrelated yet distinct sequence traditions, may be explained by Adam’s dual citizenship in the first half of the twelfth century, and by his role as the musician in charge of the cathedral liturgy during the opening decades of the musically dynamic twelfth century. That he lived in the early twelfth century is a crucial fact on which hangs much of what we can know about the development of Parisian and Victorine sequences: the texts themselves relate to the principles of reform celebrated at the Abbey, to a championing of Augustine as the patron of the Abbey, and to artistic and exegetical ideals that work in concert with the theological treatises of Hugh of St. Victor, and later of Richard as well. If Adam’s chronology is wrong, then so, too, is our understanding of the evolution of the Parisian and Victorine repertories.13

Adam’s identification has been helpful to scholars working on late sequences, providing a benchmark for establishing a chronology within the repertory. Since 1993 there have been two new translations of Victorine sequence texts with commentaries, both of which rely upon Adam’s identification to situate the works in time and to establish meanings.14 Bernadette Jollès’s work, a translation and commentary upon the Marian sequences in the Parisian repertory, appeared in 1994.15
Jean Grofillier's monumental *Les séquences d’Adam de St. Victor* (2007) is the most significant work that has been done on Adam of St. Victor in recent years, and begins with the idea that the poet is the precentor of Paris. The book offers French translations of all late sequences found in the Victorine gradual Paris lat. 14452, using another Victorine book, Paris lat. 14819, as a check (the relationship of these graduals to the Victorine Ordinal and other Parisian sequentiaries was established in *Gothic Song*). Grofillier supplies useful commentary upon the texts, and his notes identify scriptural and patristic citations. The final section of the book groups the texts by liturgical feasts and advances their major themes, sometimes with references to ideas developed in *Gothic Song*, including the ways melodies were used at the Abbey of St. Victor to group texts for exegetical and liturgical reasons. Grofillier studies poetics and rhetoric, and the themes and ideas of the Victorine texts, in an attempt to securely identify which pieces Adam wrote.

But the work on Adam remains speculative. Although sequences were created throughout the course of the twelfth century and in many Parisian centers, the first copies we have of them from the Abbey of St. Victor date from the early thirteenth century, where they appear in a standardized form, both in regard to text and music. All the early copies of sequence collections from Paris—the stray sheets and libelli that must have been circulating from place to place—are lost. The closest surviving instance of an Anglo-Norman Augustinian late sequence repertory in flux, one that may represent the kind of experimentation that surely was taking place in the twelfth century, is contained in the gradual from the Victorine-influenced St. Laurent d’Eu, studied by David Hiley. Godefroy of St. Victor worked in the third quarter of the twelfth century, and in *Gothic Song* I suggest that he may have been a redactor of the Victorine sequence repertory. He is the only identifiable Victorine who has left us a copy of a sequence, both text and music, in his own hand (“Ecce Dies Triumphalis” for St. Victor). So, although establishing the identity of Adam is helpful for explaining much about the development of the sequence repertory in Paris, both at the cathedral and at St. Victor, as well as in other churches, significant problems remain with attributions to Adam himself. We cannot prove which texts he wrote; we cannot know with certainty that he wrote sequence melodies. But because we now know who he was, and that he was the leading musician at Notre Dame Cathedral, the latter is certainly likely. The sequence repertory that the Victorines transcribed and put in liturgical order in the early thirteenth century surely contains at least some of his works, probably both his poetry and his music, and the collection as a whole is an extraordinary achievement, textually, musically, and exegetically, regardless of how many members of the community contributed to it.

Case Studies, Thematic Investigations, and Commentaries

The last two decades have been fruitful ones for the late sequence and for sequences in general. Scholars have become increasingly fascinated with the idea of “the new song,” a style of music that went hand-in-glove with developing interests in rhythmic, Latin poetry across several genres. Verse forms that depended upon numbers
of syllables rather than word accent and classical meters had been popular since the late patristic period, as a study of Augustine’s *De Musica* demonstrates. But intense experimentation with verse in this style in the second half of the eleventh century and the twelfth century is seen as a kind of watershed in the Latin Middle Ages, and one that made for great possibilities in the development of contrafacta techniques. The ways in which the sequence became a new song, and in which the genre was characteristic of the style itself, has inspired much excellent scholarship. In general, it can be organized into two categories: (1) cases studies of individual pieces, and (2) repertorial studies, sometimes with a focus on a single church, center, region, religious order, manuscript, or chronological development. Scholarly works from disciplines outside musicology and liturgy with a vested interest in sequences are often found in each category.

The study of the Easter sequence “Epithalamica,” attributed to Peter Abelard by the late lamented Chrysogonus Waddell, unleashed a torrent of new work on both Abelard and on Heloise as liturgical poets and even as composers. Scholars have continued to take particular interest in sequences whose poets or composers can be identified, and whose political or aesthetic agendas can be discerned within the texts, music, or the relationship between the two. Two essays by Michael McGrade present the contexts of individual sequences composed in the twelfth century east of the Rhine. In his study of a sequence in honor of Charlemagne, McGrade treats the sophisticated use of contrafacta technique in a readaptation of the melody for “Laudes Crucis attollamus,” a sequence that has been much studied in the wake of *Gothic Song*. Hildegard of Bingen, the sequence composer with the most securely attributable works to her name, was also, like Adam and Abelard, a poet, who wrote the texts she set to music. Hildegard did not write “new songs,” that is, her sequence texts are not written in rhyming verse depending upon syllable count. Rather, Hildegard understands the time-honored, paired versicle structure of the sequence and deliberately breaks through it, making meanings by violating expectations through various kinds of musical repetition that serve as a counterpart to formal expectations.

Studies of many individual late sequence texts are found in the monographs of Jollès and Grosfillier, mentioned above. Gunilla Björkvall and Ritva Jacobsson offer a close reading of two late sequences for the Holy Crown, one of which was written by Dominicans in Paris and the other in Sweden. Leslie Lockett has written an engaging study, with an edition and translation, of the late sequence “Lebuine Confessorum” for St. Lebuin. The poem is a tour de force, reading like rhythmic verse from top to bottom, and cast in dactylic hexameters from bottom to top. Peter Stoltz has edited a late sequence that makes the Virgin Mary the Queen of the liberal arts. The influence the genre exerted on vernacular song repertories and their texts was significant, and the scholarship on these themes offers many examples, from studies of the carol to the cantigas, and much else in between. Jean-Ives Tilliette has demonstrated the ways in which sequences incorporate materials from lives of the saints, allowing the genre to connect the Mass to the Office in intriguing ways. Felix Heinzer explores a theme that was important in Victorine and other late sequence texts. Another thematic study, by Juliet Mousseau, explores Victorine
sequences in the context of writings by Hugh of St. Victor, a strategy that is also fundamental to *Gothic Song*. The ways in which late sequence texts were set polyphonically is an area of study that is only beginning to attract attention.

Sequence Repertories of Particular Regions and Religious Communities

*Gothic Song* emphasizes the ways in which the Victorine sequences expressed the collective voice of a particular community, with spiritual needs as well as political and regional affiliations. Since 1993, many scholars, reading the repertories as blueprints for the study of culture and religious ideals, have worked on the ways in which sequences developed and flourished within a particular region. A stellar collection of essays, edited by Lori Kruckenberg and Andreas Haug, explores such themes. Its contributors outline the history of sequences as found in the archdiocese of Nidaros (1152–1537), which included Norway, Iceland, Greenland, the Faroe Islands, the Orkney Islands, and the Western Islands of Scotland. The great ordinal of Nidaros, prepared in the early thirteenth century by unknown but highly skilled liturgists, gave the liturgical practices of this archdiocese a uniformity that made for ecclesial order, but that was followed to greater or lesser degrees, as scholars writing in this collection have shown. Like other liturgical books from the archdiocese, the ordinal itself exists in a fragmentary state, and it and the sequence and other liturgical repertories have to be reconstructed from diverse parchment leaves, many of which are mere scraps. Åslaug Ommundsen, in her essay on two Norwegian sequentiary fragments, states that between ten thousand and fifteen thousand liturgical books were produced in the archdiocese, and of this lot, “no complete handwritten missal, gradual, sequentiary or other chantbook is known to have survived intact” (133). The study of such a repertory requires a great variety of skills and strategies. The authors demonstrate the importance of the sequence as a genre for understanding both the influences of other religious cultures on Norway and the creativity of native poet-composers and liturgists.

Of the eleven essays in this collection, about half relate specifically to the second-epoch sequence, most significantly, the opening study by Kruckenberg. In her overview and reconstruction of the sequence repertory from the Nidaros archdiocese, she claims that there were around 135 sequences, and that these were sung on 185 occasions, with a few more identified beyond those edited by Erik Eggen in 1968. Kruckenberg shows how rich in number this repertory is, in comparison to its Continental counterparts. Those who put it together in the early thirteenth century had eclectic tastes and were not rooted in one tradition or another. Rather, they often tried to preserve all strands. They inherited an early layer of sequences that seems to have come from Germany directly, and they retained it. Alongside this German layer, a second and later layer of pieces from England and the Continent west of the Rhine was introduced, and they kept it, too. The compilers worked during a time of repertorial transition, and so they favored the *sequentia nova*, but in adopting these newer works, they did not feel the need to excise earlier sequences. They were not as keen about the rhymed, rhythmic style of sequence favored in Paris, or at least not
did not actively import specific works, since there are but a handful of concordances with the Victorine repertory.41 Second-epoch sequences did make their way into the archdiocese of Nidaros, however, as a third layer. Kruckenberg points to the influence of both Augustinians and of Dominicans.42 As with the second layer, which contains many sequentia nova, this third layer also did not displace earlier works. Rather, these pieces were adopted for new feasts or raised feasts; others are found in manuscript fragments but not in the ordinal itself. In her study of sequences in Iceland and comparisons with the ordinal and later printed service books, Gisela Attinger demonstrates the longevity of the sequence as a genre in the archdiocese of Nidaros. Attinger suggests that the truncation of the repertory reflected in the latest sources did not take place until the late fifteenth or early sixteenth centuries. The developments detailed in Nidaros in this collection seem to parallel those in the diocese of Utrecht, although each stage began slightly later in Utrecht.43

Just as the great ordinal of the archdiocese of Nidaros has proved central to the study of sequences in this region, similarly, the ordinals of the diocese of Utrecht have inspired the study of sequences and of other chants as well.44 When scholars are dealing primarily with manuscript fragments and with lacunae in the chant tradition, ordinals can fill in the gaps. Calvin Bower’s study of the sequences of Utrecht proves that multiple influences converged in the region, while demonstrating the vitality of the genre from 1300 to 1600.45 As he states, “The problem faced by the Low-Land liturgical musician was not one of paucity of sequences, but rather of a super-abundance of possibilities, and the selection of a musical and poetic style that best harmonized with the liturgical culture and spirituality of his time and place” (49). According to Bower, there were three stages in the formation of the repertory: (1) a formative period around 1300, when large numbers of sequences were coming into the region from all directions; (2) a pruning away of many pieces in the early fifteenth century; and (3) a standardization of the repertory in the later fifteenth century. Late sequences written by Netherlandish composers entered the repertory between stages 2 and 3. As with the sequence repertory of Nidaros, no great numbers of “Victorine” or Parisian sequences immigrated into the region. The sequences written by Netherlandish composers have never been studied for what they might reveal about religion, music, and culture in the later Middle Ages and on the eve of the Reformation. Bower’s study uncovers a fascinating group of pieces to be mined by scholars in the future. New work on the sequences written for the feast of Corpus Christi is yet another related area of study, for the feast was first developed in and around Liège. The study of chant and liturgy in Liège leads to the interests that new religious orders had in sequences.46

Late sequence repertories were prominent in central Europe, and representative of the work on this music and its liturgical contexts are the essays of Hana Vlhova-Wörner. She has written on the diocese of Prague and the ways in which the sequences of the cathedral were distinct from the rest. Her work has introduced sequence manuscripts and those who composed the works, and she has also demonstrated the workings of contrafacta techniques in the repertory.47

The thirteenth century witnessed the coming of the friars—Franciscans and Dominicans—and their musical and liturgical reforms.48 The Dominican liturgy
standardized in the mid-thirteenth century largely developed in Paris, and so it
is not to be wondered at that it reflects an interest in Victorine or second-epoch
sequence as a style of liturgical song. In my “Music and the Miraculous: Mary in the
Mid-Thirteenth-Century Dominican Sequence Repertory,” I included a table pre-
pared with Philip Gleeson that catalogues sequences in the Dominican earliest
manuscripts, a list that has proven useful to scholars working in regions where the
Dominicans were instrumental in the formation of local musical and liturgical prac-
tices. Study of the first layers of Dominican sequences demonstrates that the friars
used the sequences familiar to them but truncated them, changing the sequences
they adapted from the Parisian repertory and writing new sequences in the same
style, often relating these to their hagiographic agenda. Yet even here, the wholesale
importation of Parisian sequences did not take place, and as we have seen both in
Norway and in Utrecht, the influence was primarily one of style and taste rather
than of actual pieces. Victorine sequences were written and composed for a par-
ticular time and place and apparently did not transfer well directly, at least not in
large numbers. The single exception to the general lack of broad interest is a large
collection of specific pieces from Paris and from the Abbey of St. Victor in Assisi,
Bibl. Com. MS 695. But this collection is a special case, an anthology rather than a
book for liturgical use. There seem to be differences between the ways that poly-
phonic repertories and sequence repertories spread within Paris and did, or did not,
move out to other regions. The Parisian polyphonic repertories, as can be seen
through studies of W1 and of its copying in St. Andrew’s, Scotland, were more likely
to be copied from exemplars, suggesting that the notation and musical genres were
not well understood by local musicians. Sequences, on the other hand, could be
written locally, because poets were skilled in the various forms of late medieval
rhythmic poetry and in contrafacta techniques, and so specific pieces did not need
to be made available to local musicians.

The use of sequences in the liturgies of Dominican nuns has been much studied
ever since the seminal work on the nuns of Katharinenthal, sparked by the facsimile
edition (1979) of their visually magnificent early-fourteenth-century graduale with
its sequentiary. The nuns of Katharinenthal, like other late medieval religious
women, including beguines, had a special devotion for St. John the Evangelist, the
saint “whom Jesus loved,” and who was named the son of Mary by Jesus. Jeffrey
Hamburger has organized a conference and edited a collection of essays on the topic
of two leaves from an extraordinary liturgical book created by the Dominican nuns
of Paradise bei Soest in Westphalia. Two contributors, Lori Kruckenberg and
Nancy van Deusen, treat the late sequence as related to the ritual and art of the
women who illuminated this and other books that constitute what are perhaps the
most ornately decorated manuscripts from the entire Middle Ages. The sequences
sung by Franciscans or prepared under their influence remain an understudied topic,
perhaps because there are fewer of them.

Sequences continued to be written and sung on an occasional basis long after Tri-
dentine reforms removed most of them from the Roman rite. Barbara Haagh-
Huglo has studied the sequences of the Victorine Simon Gourdan (1646–1729),
who was both a historian of the early centuries of the Abbey of St. Victor and also a
poet, and who attempted to re-create the glories of the sequence repertory by writing a history of the Abbey, liturgical commentary, and liturgical texts. Fourier Bonnard, in his history of the Abbey of St. Victor, includes a sketch of the difficult struggles with Jansenism in the Abbey, led by Simon Gourdan. Simon’s sequence repertory, which was copied at least in the Cathedral of Cambrai and had a circulation in Paris, has never been closely studied.

Another way in which sequences continued to have an impact on religious life was through the commentary, a genre that has been lately studied by Erika Kihlman. Kihlman has worked with over two hundred manuscripts of sequence commentaries, and her book *Expositiones Sequentiarum* concentrates on but one sequence from this rich tradition, “Ad Celebres Rex” for St. Michael. The audience for sequence commentaries varied, as do the works themselves, which range across several levels of proficiency regarding Latin language, grammar, and literary or theological studies. The commentaries also take us back to the Abbey of St. Victor, where Josse Clichtove (Clichtoveus) (d. 1543) wrote an explication of various liturgical texts, including sequences. His studies were part of the arguments raging in the early sixteenth century over biblical authority, in which the liturgy was sometimes consulted to make judgments about figures such as Mary Magdalene. Clichtove’s understanding of the sequences of his own abbey and their tradition is a subject ripe for study.

The Victorine sequences present an integrated sounding image of the church that can be comprehended only through singing in community. Taken as a whole, this repertory is the most complex witness to the art of memory that survives from the Latin Middle Ages, and it functioned through the interaction of music and poetry within a liturgical framework. It only makes sense to those who interacted with each other within the web of sound created at the Abbey, and this may be why it was never transplanted to any other institution. It is an art that requires participation and that attempts to transform the participants. It is an art that shapes identity, both for individuals and for community, and one that relates to the shape of the church building and to the dedicatees of the altars within that particular church. The Victorine sequences embody a unique art of memory, but they also remind us that every sequence repertory provides a special window onto the community that sang it. In the Victorine repertory, individual elements were arranged into larger wholes, suggesting the formal principles known today as “Gothic.”

Are there ways that an understanding of the Victorine sequence repertory can shed light on other contemporary liturgical art forms? In a recent book on the west facade of Chartres Cathedral and the cult of the Virgin, I used musical and liturgical materials to help explain the understanding of history found at Chartres. In the art of twelfth-century Chartres, I found principles operating that were similar to those found at the Abbey of St. Victor, but they manifested themselves most profoundly in the visual arts rather than in the liturgical music. It seems that there is more to do in understanding the art, music, and liturgical ideals of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, and that the Victorines and their sequences offer models for how to work.
Notes

In the notes to this introduction, I provide full citations only for works not in the bibliography or list of abbreviations of Gothic Song. For works already in the bibliography or list of abbreviations, I give the full author or editor name and full title on first occurrence, and sometimes the year of publication.

1 E. Rohloff, ed., Die Quellenhandschriften zum Musiktraktat des Johannes de Grocheio (Leipzig, 1972), 65. Grocheo’s comparison of the sequence to the ductia, a kind of dance, is a strategy he adopts for select other genres of chant as well; at least some of information he provides is formulaic in nature. For discussion of the range of scholarly opinions on the usefulness of his descriptive work, see Robert Mullally, “Johannes de Grocheo’s ‘Musica Vulgaris,’” Music and Letters 79 (1998): 1–26. The sequence is sung in the manner of the ductia, Grocheo writes, because “it leads and makes glad, so that they might rightly receive the words of the Gospel.” As no examples of the ductia per se survive, scholars have speculated upon the form and tried to link it to some pieces in the repertory; the sung version of the ductia is now connected to the carole. See Christopher Page, The Owl and the Nightingale: Musical Life and Ideas in France, 1100–1300 (Berkeley, 1990), 110–133; Mullally, “Johannes de Grocheo’s ‘Musica Vulgaris,’” 10–11; and Judith Peraino, “Replacing Medieval Music,” JAMS 54 (2001): 209–264, at 223–224.


3 The many late sequence texts edited in the volumes of Analecta hymnica provide the best way of evaluating the numbers of manuscripts that contained them, and their geographical concentrations. Calvin Bower has prepared a massive database including all sequences currently known, which will soon appear on line; Nancy van Deusen has compiled a catalogue of sequence manuscripts, now forthcoming.

4 As can be seen from the bibliography and notes of Gothic Song, study of the music of the Victorine and other sequence repertories was primarily found in the notes and introductions to various editions and translations of texts. Major editions of late sequence repertories include Eugène Misset and Pierre Aubry, eds., Les proses d’Adam de Saint-Victor: texte et musique précédées d’une étude critique; Clemens Blume and Henry Marriot Bannister, eds., Thesauri hymnologici prosarium: Liturgische Prosae des Übergangsstiles und der zweiten Epoche, insbesondere die dem Adam von Sankt Viktor zugeschriebenen, aus Handschriften und Frühanducken, Analecta hymnica mediæ ævi 54 (Leipzig, 1915); Carl Moberg, Über die schwedischen Sequenzen, eine musikgeschichtliche Studie, 2 vols. (Uppsala, 1927); Gabriel Zwick, ed., Les Proses en usage à l’église de Saint-Nicholas à Fribourg jusqu’au dix-huitième siècle (Immensée, 1950); Toni Schmid, ed., Graduale Arosiense impressum (which contains the sequence repertory of late medieval Sweden), 4 parts (Lund, 1959–1965); René-Jean Hesbert, ed., Le Prosaire de la Sainte-Chapelle: manuscrit de Saint-Nicholas de Bari (Vers 1250); idem, ed., Le Prosaire d’Aix-la-Chapelle, XIIIe siècle, début; idem, ed., Le tropaire-prosaire de Dublin; Erik Eggen, ed., The Sequences of the Archbishopric of Nidaros, 2 vols. (Copenhagen, 1968); and Nicholas de Goede, ed., The Utrecht Prosarium: Liber sequen-


Kruckenberg’s “The Sequence from 1050–1150: Study of a Genre in Change” (Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1997) shows that there were many competing ideas about sequences, existing side by side over a considerable period of time, rather than a relentless drive to the Victorine sequence. Her essay on the variety of performances that were afforded sequences, and the purely melodic versions of them as well, has also opened up fresh understandings of the creative ways the genre was used in medieval liturgical practices; see her “Neumatizing the Sequence: Special Performances of Sequences in the Central Middle Ages,” *JAMS* 59 (2006): 243–317. Kruckenberg’s study is related to themes in chapters 2 and 3 of *Gothic Song*, both studies of liturgical commentators and of the sequence as an Alleluia commentary. The angelic vocabulary of the sequence was first explored in detail by Lars Elfving, *Étude lexicographique sur les séquences limousines* (1962), and more recently by Gunilla Iversen in her *Chanter avec les anges: poésie dans la messe médiévale, interprétations et commentaires* (Paris, 2001); and in English as *Laus Angelica: Poetry in the Medieval Mass*, ed. Jane Flynn, trans. William Flynn (Turnhout, 2010).

The true pioneer in this regard has been Josef Szövérffy, especially his “Der Investiturstreit und die Petrus-Hymnen des Mittelalters” and “A Mirror of Medieval Culture: St. Peter Hymns of the Middle Ages,” noted above, and “Religiöse Dichtung als Kulturphänomen und Kulturleistung.” Anne Walters Robertson’s *The Service-Books of the Royal Abbey of Saint-Denis: Images of Ritual and Music in the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 1991) contains a study of the significant repertory of sequences written at the Abbey of St. Denis in the thirteenth century. Further study of late sequences composed for the cult of Denis in Paris and elsewhere is found in Tova Choate, “The Liturgical Faces of Saint Denis: Music, Power, and Identity in Medieval France” (Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 2009). Karl Prassl’s thesis “Psallat ecclesia mater: Studien zu Repertoire und Verwendung von Sequenzen in der Liturgie österreichischer Augustinerchorherren vom 12. bis zum 16. Jh” (University of Graz, 1987) remains one of the most important studies of regional late sequence repertories; unfortunately it was never published and is difficult to obtain.

Earlier sequence repertories will not be discussed in this overview, with c. 1100 serving as a general cutoff point. Trope repertories also will not be discussed, but it should be noted that the relationship between proper tropes and late sequences has been significantly nuanced in recent years. The most important work in this regard is Andreas Haug, *Trioparia tardiva: Repertorium später Tropenquellen aus dem deutschsprachigen Raum*, Monumenta Monodica Medii Aevi, Subsida 1 (Kassel, 1995). Following Haug and others, it is

Most useful in this regard is Eugene Cunnar’s study of “Zyma vetus” and the effects of rhyming, in his “Typological Rhyme in a Sequence of Adam of St. Victor” (1987). He states, “Rhyming effects carry the affective content of the poem by appealing to the listener’s desires for the stability that is suggested by recurrence and repetition. . . . Rhyming effects mirror the temporal pattern of concealment and revealment in typology” (413–414).

There are some useful guides to performance that cover late sequences and Latin cantica nova, but only minimally, given the great potential of the genre. See Bernard Sherman, Inside Early Music: Conversations with Performers (Oxford, 1997); Ross Duffin, A Performer’s Guide to Medieval Music (Bloomington, IN, 2000); and Timothy McGee, The Sound of Medieval Song: Ornaments and Vocal Style According to the Treatises (New York, 1997). Always helpful for performers and listeners alike are the CD reviews of Jerome Weber, who treats not only Gregorian chant but also the newer genres and polyphonic works.

The anthology in Gothic Song provides the music for all major families of sequences sung at the abbey, and shows the ways in which they are interrelated. L’École de Saint-Victor de Paris: Influence et Rayonnement du Moyen Âge à l’Époque Moderne, ed. Dominique Poirel, Bibliotheca Victorina 22, contains my “The Victorine Sequences Revisited: 1993–2009” (Turnhout, 2010), 433–457. The volume also includes a CD of a performance by the Maîtrise Notre-Dame de Paris of some Victorine sequences and other medieval Parisian repertory.

Further discussion and references can be found in my “Who Was Adam of St. Victor? The Evidence of the Sequence Manuscripts” (1984). Richard claimed that a great poet (assumed to be Adam) wrote “Ave virgo singularis, mater,” and he also mentions the sequence “Zyma vetus,” a text given a uniquely Victorine melody at the Abbey, one used to link a group of three texts exegetically. Thomas of Cantimpré stated that Adam wrote “Salve mater salvatoris.”

See the introductory essay to Analecta hymnica, vol. 54.

Brepols (Turnhout) has announced a new series that will include translations of the Victorine sequence texts: Abbey of St Victor: Victorine Texts in Translation.

Adam de Saint-Victor, Quatorze proses du XIIe siècle à la louange de Marie, ed., trans., and notes by Bernadette Jollès (Turnhout, 1994).

Jean Grofillier, Les séquences d’Adam de St. Victor: étude littéraire (poétique et rhétorique), textes et traductions, commentaire (Turnhout, 2007).

The status of two sources used for the sake of comparison with Victorine/Parisian sequence repertories needs clarification. The twelfth-century ordinal from Chartres Cathedral, Châteaudun, Hôtel Dieu 13, assumed to have been lost, was found in 2007.
and is now being restored. The twelfth-century ordinal from St. John in the Valley in Chartres (Paris, BN lat. 1794) does represent the liturgy of that church, but as prepared for Sidon; see Anneliese Maier, “Die Handschriften der Ecclesia Sidonensis,” Manuskripta 11 (1967): 39–45.

18 My “The Victorine Sequences Revisited” contains a more detailed study of Grosfillier’s attributions to Adam.


20 Alejandro Planchart, in “Fragments, Palimpsests, and Marginalia,” Journal of Musicology 3 (1988): 293–339, at 308, notes that material from this sequence for St. Victor was adapted as a trope for the introit in several German manuscripts from the thirteenth century. He cites Graz, Universitätsbibliothek MS 756, fol. 181r, as an example.

21 Dag Norberg’s classic introduction to medieval Latin prosody (published in French in 1958) has both laid the foundation for and established the intricacies of medieval rhythmic verse. The study has now appeared in an English translation, edited and with an introduction reviewing scholarship on the subject by Jan Ziolkowski: An Introduction to the Study of Medieval Latin Versification, trans. G. C. Roti and J. D. Skubly (Washington, DC, 2004). A. A. Bastaensens’s “L’histoire d’un vers: le septenaire trochoïde de l’Antiquité au Moyen Âge,” Humanitas 50 (1998): 173–187, is a study of the form identified by Norberg as that from which the traditional late sequence verse pattern descends.


24 See Waddell’s “‘Epithalamica’: An Easter Sequence by Peter Abelard,” *The Musical Quarterly* 72 (1986): 239–271. Constant Mews believes that this magnificent sequence may have been written by Heloise: see his “Hugh Metel, Heloise, and Peter Abelard: The Letters of an Augustinian Canon and the Challenge of Innovation in Twelfth-Century Lorraine,” *Viator* 32 (2001): 59–91. On Abelard and liturgical verse more generally, see Gunilla Iversen, “Abélard et la poésie liturgique,” in *Pierre Abélard: Colloque international de Nantes*, ed. Jean Jolivet and Henri Habrias (Rennes, 2003), 233–260. Liturgical texts and innovations can be ascribed to Abelard and Heloise, for which, see especially Joseph Szövérffy, ed., *Peter Abelard’s Hymnarius Paradisiensis: An Annotated Edition with Introduction*, 2 vols. (Albany, NY, 1975). Most attributions of liturgical music to Abelard and Heloise, however, with the exception of the planctus, are speculative. For example, see *The Poetic and Musical Legacy of Heloise and Abelard: An Anthology of Essays by Various Authors*, ed. Marc Stewart and David Wulstan (Ottowa, 2003), which places a range of works within what Wulstan calls the “school of Abelard,” including songs from the *Carmina Burana*, and dramatic works. Of Abelard’s six planctus, only one survives in notation allowing for absolute precision of pitches, although scholars and composers have made attempts to reconstruct the melodies.


27 As McGrade points out, “Laudes Crucis” seems to have been written to celebrate the victory of the First Crusade, and so would have been composed in the early years of the twelfth century. Nicholas Weisbein, in his “Les ‘laudes crucis attollamus’ de Maître Hugues d’Orleans le Primat” (1947), attributed it to Hugh Primas of Orleans, citing passages from local necrologies, and studied the early manuscript tradition of the piece. It seems to be northern French, and it was picked upon immediately by the Victorines, who wrote new melodies based upon it. It is tempting to attribute it to Adam, who was already flourishing at the time it must have been composed, but there is no proof, and most scholars accept Weisbein’s arguments, although with reservations, because Hugh Primas was even younger than Adam of St. Victor. The “Laudes Crucis” melody draws heavily upon the Alleluia “Dulce Lignum,” edited in Karl Schlagler’s *Alleluia-Melodien I, bis 1100*, Monumenta Monodica Medii Aevi 7 (1968), 140, commentary on 631. For a recent study of the “sequela” and sequence texts written for it, see David Hiley, “Dulce Lignum Maior et Minor,” *Études Grégoriennes* 27 (2009): 159–172.


33 Jean-Ives Tilliette, “Hymnes et séquences hagiographiques: formes et fonctions de la réécriture lyrique des vies de saints,” Hagiographica 10 (2003): 161–181. Sequences as related to the cults of two late saints have been studied by Terry David Brown in his “Songs for the Saints of the Schism: Liturgies for Vincent Ferrer and Catherine of Siena” (Ph.D. diss., University of Toronto, 1995). Both his work and that of Tova Choate (see n. 7) demonstrate the importance of contrafacta for adding layers of meaning to the musical dimensions of saints’ cults.


36 Brian Gillingham’s “A History of the Polyphonic Sequence in the Middle Ages” (Ph.D. diss., University of Washington, 1976) and his subsequent The Polyphonic Sequences in


This overview of Kruckenberg and Haug, eds., *The Sequences of Nidaros*, is adapted from my “The Victorine Sequences Revisited.” The most important fragments of the ordinal come from Iceland, and the book was reconstructed and edited by Lilli Gjerløw, *Ordo Nidrosiensis Ecclesiae (Orðubók)* (Oslo, 1968). Gjerløw dated its compilation to between 1205 and 1225. Several authors in Kruckenberg and Haug refine our understanding of this liturgical source in a variety of ways. For the thirteenth-century cathedral building and its relationship to ritual, see Margrethe Syrstad Andas, Oystein Ekroll, Andreas Haug, and Nils Holger Petersen, eds., *The Medieval Cathedral of Trondheim: Architectural and Ritual Constructions in Their European Context* (Turnhout, 2007). Ordinals provide the incipits for chants and liturgical texts and are organized by feasts; thus, they provide crucial information about the status of any medieval chant repertory and have been much studied by chant scholars. Recent work on the sequences of Nidaros is dependent upon the fundamental study of Eggen, *The Sequences of the Archbishopric of Nidarós* (see n. 4).

See Åslaug Ommundsen, “Two Selected Sequence Sources from Norway,” in *The Sequences of Nidaros*, ed. Kruckenberg and Haug, 135–163. This study compares two manuscript fragments, one of which shows independence from the ordinal, and the other dependence upon its standardization of the liturgy. It would seem that there was a certain amount of flexibility in the ways the ordinal was followed or not followed throughout this enormous diocese. Her “Books, Scribes, and Sequences in Medieval Norway” (Ph.D. diss., University of Bergen, 2007), is a masterful survey of surviving fragments, with a catalogue, available online at the Bergen Open Research Archive, https://bora.uib.no/. Ommundsen explores the tension between the ordinal and the exemplar, or liturgical source book, and advocates further analysis of the copious surviving fragments.


Kruckenberg, “Making a Sequence Repertory,” 37, and Hiley in his “The English Background to the Nidaros Sequences,” in *The Sequences of Nidaros*, ed. Kruckenberg and Haug, 66, both comment on the ease with which Victorine sequences could have been imported to Norway. Lilli Gjerløw notes in her edition of the ordinal (109) that both Archbishop Eirik (1189–1205) and Archbishop Tore (1206–1214) were associated with the Abbey of St. Victor and spent time in Paris at a period when Victorine sequences were in ascendancy in the city and when the work of compiling the ordinal was in progress. Ommundsen and others hosted a conference in summer 2009 to explore the vexed question of Parisian influence on the northern sequence repertory in the thirteenth century.

See Kruckenberg, “Making a Sequence Repertory,” 36–41. The Dominican influence was even stronger in Sweden; for an overview of the sequence repertory of Sweden, which must also be reconstructed from manuscript fragments, see Gunilla Björkvall, “Sequences in the Fragments at the Swedish National Archives,” in *The Sequences of Nidaros*, ed. Kruckenberg and Haug, 45–62.

The entire issue of *Tijdschrift van de Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 53 (2003) is dedicated to study of the chant and liturgy of the diocese of Utrecht.


Of special use in this regard is Barbara R. Walters, Vincent Corrigan, and Peter T. Rick- etts, *The Feast of Corpus Christi* (University Park, PA, 2006) which contains a study and transcriptions of the sequence found in the early liturgy for the feast developed by Juliana of Mont Cornillon and her associate John. The later sequence attributed to Thomas Aquinas, “Lauda Sion,” a contrafact of “Laudes Crucis,” is also edited and discussed in this work.


The study of Dominican liturgical and musical traditions in recent decades has been revelatory. Manuscript production by Dominicans in Perugia in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries is represented by a magnificent catalogue and a series of essays by specialists, with some attention to sequence repertories: *Canto e colore: i corali di San Domenico di Perugia nella Biblioteca comunale Augusta (xiii–xiv sec.),* ed. Claudia Parmeggiani (Perugia, 2006).


Jeffrey F. Hamburger’s *St. John the Divine: The Defied Evangelist in Medieval Art and Theology* (Berkeley, 2002) lays out the nature of the cult and its special appeal for late medieval nuns and other religious women.


Judith Oliver’s study of the richly illuminated Rulle gradual, dated c. 1300, includes an inventory of the sequentiary, which may be a slightly later addition to the book: *Singing with Angels: Liturgy, Music, and Art in the Gradual of Gisela von Kerssenbrock* (Brepols, 2007).
The sequences are for the most part not late works, and none of them, including the handful dating from the twelfth century, is distinctive. In general, Cistercians did not sing sequences in their liturgies, although the texts were sometimes used for mediation and private devotion in Cistercian houses and it is clear that some Cistercians wrote sequences. One of the most famous Cistercian books containing sequences is Oxford, Bodleian MS lat. liturg. d. 5, from Hauterive. The sequences are part of a later addition and have not been studied in any detail. Carthusians also did not sing sequences, although here, too, one can find exceptions. The ways in which liturgical understandings permeated Carthusian religious life in late medieval England are described in Jessica Brantley’s Reading in the Wilderness: Private Devotion and Public Performance in Late Medieval England (Chicago, 2007).

56 For studies of some survivals, see Theodore Karp, An Introduction to the Post-Tridentine Mass Proper, 2 vols., Musicological Studies and Documents 54 (Middleton, WI, 2005), and especially his “Sequences of the 18th and 19th Centuries,” in Dies est leticie: Essays on Chant in Honour of Janka Szendrei, ed. David Hiley and Gábor Kiss (Ottawa, 2008).

57 Gourdan wrote a commentary on the Mass, Sacrifice perpetuel de foi et d’amour au tres-saint sacrament: par rapport aux mysteres et aux diferentes qualitiés de N. S. Jesus-Christ énoncées dans l’Ecriture-Sainte (Paris, 1763); sequences (in Paris, B.N. lat. 14841); and his history of the Abbey, Vies et Maximes saintes des hommes illustres de Saint Victor. His autograph copy of the latter is in the Bibliothèque Mazarine 3348–3354; another copy is B.N. fr. 23936–23941.


61 See Kihlman, Expositiones, 23.

62 See Josse Clichtove, Elucidatorium ecclesiasticum: ad officium ecclesiae pertinentia planius exponens, & quatuor libros complectens (Basil, 1517).


65 Boyd Taylor Coolman, The Theology of Hugh of St. Victor: An Interpretation (Cambridge, 2010), has much in common with Gothic Song, and argues, as does it, for the importance of Victorine theology to the formal characteristics of twelfth-century art and architecture.