Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments xi

CHAPTER ONE
Setting the Stage: The Problem with Rationality 1
  Two Concepts of Rational Action 1
  Normative Diversity: An Introduction 8
  Rorty’s Relativism 11
  The Road Taken 18
  The Argument 24

PART I. THROUGH THICK AND THIN

Introduction 32

CHAPTER TWO
Comparative Irrealism and Community-Based Semantics:
Kripkenstein and Beyond 35
  Normativity through Thick and Thin 35
  Normative Diversity 37
  Comparative Irrealism: The Philosophical Thesis 41
  In Defense of Comparative Irrealism 45
  Conclusion: Irrealism and Relativism 54

© 2011 University of Notre Dame
Contents

CHAPTER THREE
Factuality without Realism: Normativity and the Davidsonian Approach to Meaning 56
   The Argument 56
   Theoretical and Normative Diversity in Davidsonian Theories of Meaning 61
   Factuality without Realism 74

PART II. RATIONALITY FROM WITHIN

Introduction 86

CHAPTER FOUR
The Limits of Connectiveness: Criticism from Within and the Interpretive Account of Normativity 92
   Introduction 92
   Truth by Interpretation 93
   The Thick and the True 96
   The Thin and the Void 98
   Comparative Irrealism and the Limits of Normative Comparison 100
   Two Objections 102
   The Interpretive Account and the Open Question Argument 109
   Taking Stock 117

CHAPTER FIVE
Rationality as Agreement: Friedman’s Special Case for Science 119
   Introduction 119
   From Kant to Kuhn 122
   The Problem of Rationality: Carnap, Kuhn, and Conceptual Relativism 125
   Science in Context 131
   An “Is” for an “Ought” 156

CHAPTER SIX
Toward a Critical Pragmatism: A Brandomian Beginning 160
   Friedman, McDowell, and Beyond 160
   Interpretivism Revisited: Enter Brandom 166

© 2011 University of Notre Dame
Contents

Making Brandom Explicit I: The Constitutive Role of Conceptual Norms 172
Making Brandom Explicit II: The Normative and the Critical 175

PART III. NORMATIVE SELF-CRITICISM

Introduction 192

CHAPTER SEVEN
The Critical Stance 194
Brandom on the Rationality of Norm Making 194
Making Criticism Explicit 202
The Teleology of Problemhood 208
The Critical Stance 219

CHAPTER EIGHT
The Achievement of Self-Criticism 229
The Critical Moment 229
Toward a Frankfurtian Analysis of Normative Criticism 234
Normativity and “the Contingent Necessities of Love” 236
Getting Ourselves Wrong: Frankfurt on Normative Self-Criticism 239
“Socializing Harry” 247
Within You and Without You: The Self’s Normative Dialogue 254
The Achievement of Normative Self-Criticism 266

CHAPTER NINE
Science Revisited 272
Taking Stock 272
Back to Science I: Meta-Frameworks, Trading Zones, and Beyond 279
Back to Science II: The Force of Creative Indecision 291
In Conclusion 297

Notes 302
Bibliography 357
Index 375

© 2011 University of Notre Dame